



**MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM OF MICHIGAN**  
ANNUAL ACTUARIAL VALUATION REPORT DECEMBER 31, 2015  
YPSILANTI, CITY OF (8101)



Spring, 2016

Ypsilanti, City of

In care of:  
Municipal Employees' Retirement System of Michigan  
1134 Municipal Way  
Lansing, Michigan 48917

This report presents the results of the Annual Actuarial Valuation, prepared as of December 31, 2015. The report includes the determination of liabilities and contribution rates resulting from the participation of Ypsilanti, City of (8101) in the Municipal Employees' Retirement System of Michigan ("MERS"). MERS is a nonprofit organization, independent from the State, that has provided retirement plans for municipal employees for more than 65 years. Ypsilanti, City of is responsible for the employer contributions needed to provide MERS benefits for its employees and former employees under the Michigan Constitution and the MERS Plan Document.

The purpose of the December 31, 2015 annual actuarial valuation is to:

- Measure funding progress
- Establish contribution requirements for the fiscal year beginning July 1, 2017
- Provide actuarial information in connection with applicable Governmental Accounting Standards Board (GASB) statements

This valuation report should not be relied upon for any other purpose. Reliance on information contained in this report by anyone for anything other than the intended purpose could be misleading.

The valuation uses financial data, plan provision data, and participant data as of December 31, 2015 furnished by MERS. In accordance with Actuarial Standards of Practice No. 23, the data was checked for internal and year to year consistency as well as general reasonableness, but was not otherwise audited. CBIZ Retirement Plan Services does not assume responsibility for the accuracy or completeness of the data used in this valuation.

The actuarial assumptions and methods are adopted by the MERS Retirement Board, and are reviewed every five years in an Experience Study. The most recent study was completed in 2015, and this December 31, 2015 valuation report reflects changes in assumptions and methods. Please refer to the division-specific assumptions described in table(s) in this report, and to the Appendix on the MERS website at:

[www.mersofmich.com/Portals/0/Assets/Resources/AAV-Appendix/MERS-2015AnnualActuarialValuation-Appendix.pdf](http://www.mersofmich.com/Portals/0/Assets/Resources/AAV-Appendix/MERS-2015AnnualActuarialValuation-Appendix.pdf).



The actuarial assumptions used for this valuation produce results that we believe are reasonable.

To the best of our knowledge, this report is complete and accurate, was prepared in conformity with generally recognized actuarial principles and practices, with the Actuarial Standards of Practice issued by the Actuarial Standards Board, and is in compliance with Act No. 220 of the Public Acts of 1996, as amended, and the MERS Plan Document as revised. All of the undersigned are members of the American Academy of Actuaries (MAAA), and meet the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries to render the actuarial opinion contained herein. The Retirement Board of the Municipal Employees' Retirement System of Michigan confirms that the System provides for payment of the required employer contribution as described in Section 20m of Act No. 314 of 1965 (MCL 38.1140m).

This information is purely actuarial in nature. It is not intended to serve as a substitute for legal, accounting or investment advice.

**This report was prepared at the request of the Retirement Board and may be provided only in its entirety by the municipality to other interested parties (MERS customarily provides the full report on request to associated third parties such as the auditor for the municipality). CBIZ Retirement Plan Services is not responsible for the consequences of any unauthorized use.**

You should notify MERS if you disagree with anything contained in the report or are aware of any information that would affect the results of the report that have not been communicated to us. If you have reason to believe that the plan provisions are incorrectly described, that important plan provisions relevant to this valuation are not described, that conditions have changed since the calculations were made, that the information provided in this report is inaccurate or is in anyway incomplete, or if you need further information in order to make an informed decision on the subject matter in this report, please contact your Regional Manager at 1.800.767.MERS(6377).

Sincerely,

Cathy Nagy, MAAA, FSA  
Jim Koss, MAAA, ASA  
Curtis Powell, MAAA, EA  
Alan Sonnanstine, MAAA, ASA

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

	<b>Page</b>
Executive Summary	5
Employer Contribution Details	15
Table 1	
Benefit Provisions	17
Table 2	
Participant Summary	20
Table 3	
Reported Assets (Market Value)	21
Table 4	
Flow of Valuation Assets	22
Table 5	
Actuarial Accrued Liabilities and Valuation Assets	23
Table 6	
Actuarial Accrued Liabilities - Comparative Schedule	25
Table 7	
Division-Based Comparative Schedules	26
Tables 8 and 9	
GASB 68 Information	33
Benefit Provision History	34
Plan Provisions, Actuarial Assumptions, and Actuarial Funding Method	36

## Executive Summary

---

### New Actuarial Assumptions and Methods

The actuarial assumptions and methods are adopted by the MERS Retirement Board, and are reviewed every five years in an Experience Study. The Experience Study is a comprehensive, detailed analysis that reviews MERS' funding policy and compares actual experience with the current actuarial assumptions; the study recommends adjustments as necessary. The most recent study was completed in 2015, and this December 31, 2015 valuation report reflects several changes in actuarial assumptions.

The main assumption and method changes were:

- The mortality table was adjusted to reflect longer lifetimes.
- The assumed annual rate of investment return, net of all expenses, was lowered from 8% to 7.75%.
- The asset smoothing was changed from 10 to 5 years.
- The amortization period was moved to a fixed period amortization for the December 31, 2014 annual valuations.
  - o The period will continue to gradually decrease for both open and closed divisions until the current unfunded accrued liability (UAL) is completely paid off.
  - o Moving to this type of "fixed period amortization" means that all unfunded liabilities will be fully funded by a specific date in the future.
  - o Once the amortization period drops below 15 years (10 years for closed divisions), any future liability and asset gains or losses will be spread over a 15-year fixed period for open divisions and a 10-year fixed period for closed divisions — creating "layers" of UAL on an annual basis.
  - o This transparent method allows tracking of what changed your UAL, and sets a fixed period in time in which that UAL change will be fully funded.

Various other actuarial assumptions were revised, but the revisions had a smaller impact than the two assumption changes above (first two bullets). For a summary of all of the actuarial assumptions and methods, please refer to the division-specific assumptions described on the last page of this report, and to the [Appendix](#).

The new amortization period layers and the new 5-year asset smoothing do not impact this 2015 annual valuation, other than the 6 year projections. These method changes will first impact the December 31, 2016 annual valuations.

The impacts of the assumption changes on the funded ratio and the required employer contributions are displayed on the next few pages. While these changes in assumptions will mean larger liabilities and contributions than anticipated by the prior assumptions for most employers, they will ensure each employer makes reasonable progress towards funding the unfunded liabilities of the employer. When

discussing changes in assumptions it is important to remember that, although the assumptions used impact the annual contributions, the true cost of the plan will be based on what will actually happen in the future – independent of the assumptions used. MERS recognizes that many municipalities are already taking steps to reduce their UAL. The MERS Board approved a “phase in” of the total impact of the assumption changes over the next 5 years (impacting fiscal years beginning 2017 – 2021) as an option for you. Of course, if the employer pays less in the first 4 years, they will likely have to pay somewhat more in later years.

MERS created a dedicated resource page on their website, [www.mersofmich.com](http://www.mersofmich.com), regarding this topic, with links to frequently asked questions, upcoming events and additional details.

### **Impacts from the Assumption Changes**

The new actuarial assumptions changed your December 31, 2015 percent funded from 136% to 129%, a change of -7%.

The new assumptions changed your total monthly employer contribution requirement, before any phase-in, from \$5,214 to \$5,822, a change of \$608 (a 12% increase). Under the 5-year phase-in the first year increase is instead 2% (from \$5,214 to \$5,334 monthly).

Additional detail is shown on the following pages.

## Funded Ratio and Required Employer Contributions

The MERS Defined Benefit Plan is an agent multiple-employer plan, meaning that assets are pooled for investment purposes but separate accounts are maintained for each individual employer. Each municipality is responsible for their own plan liabilities; MERS does not borrow from one municipality's account to pay for another.

The funded ratio of a plan is the percentage of the dollar value of the accrued benefits that is covered by the actuarial value of assets.

### Your Funded Ratio:

For comparison purposes, we have included your December 31, 2015 funded ratio if it had been calculated under the previous assumptions. Note: Your actual funded level as of December 31, 2015 is the amount listed under the new assumptions.

	New Assumptions	Previous Assumptions	
	12/31/2015	12/31/2015	12/31/2014
<b>Funded Ratio</b>	129%	136%	140%

Michigan Law requires that pension plans be pre-funded, meaning money is set aside now to pay for future benefits. Pension plans are usually funded by employer and employee contributions, and investment income.

How quickly a plan attains the 100% funding goal depends on many factors such as:

- The current funded ratio
- The future experience of the plan
- The amortization period

It is more important to look at the trend in the funded ratio over a period of time than at a particular point in time.

**Your Required Employer Contributions:**

Your computed employer contributions are shown in the following table. Employee contributions, if any, are in addition to the computed employer contributions. Note: Your minimum required contribution is the amount listed under the new assumptions, with phase-in. For comparison purposes, we have included your computed employer contribution if it had been calculated under the previous assumptions.

	Percentage of Payroll				Monthly \$ Based on Valuation Payroll			
	New Assumptions		Previous Assumptions		New Assumptions		Previous Assumptions	
	Phase-in	Full Impact			Phase-in	Full Impact		
Valuation Date:	12/31/2015	12/31/2015	12/31/2015	12/31/2014	12/31/2015	12/31/2015	12/31/2015	12/31/2014
Fiscal Year Beginning:	July 1, 2017	July 1, 2017	July 1, 2017	July 1, 2016	July 1, 2017	July 1, 2017	July 1, 2017	July 1, 2016
<b>Division</b>								
01 - Gnrl Non Un	-	-	-	-	\$ 0	\$ 0	\$ 0	\$ 0
10 - Gnrl AFSCME	-	-	-	-	0	0	0	0
11 - Gnrl Dspth	-	-	-	-	0	0	0	0
14 - Cty Mgr	-	-	-	-	15	79	0	0
15 - City Mgr. aft. 7/1/201	3.42%	4.95%	3.02%	0.85%	312	452	277	66
16 - AFSCME after 7/1/2010	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0	0	0	0
17 - Non-Union after 1/1/20	6.50%	6.87%	6.37%	7.49%	5,007	5,291	4,937	1,641
<b>Municipality Total</b>					<b>\$ 5,334</b>	<b>\$ 5,822</b>	<b>\$ 5,214</b>	<b>\$ 1,707</b>

Under the new assumptions, both the full impact and the phased in employer contribution requirements are shown in the table above. The phase in allows the employer to spread the increase of the new actuarial assumptions over 5 fiscal years. By default, MERS will invoice you the phased in contribution amount. However, MERS strongly encourages employers to contribute more than the minimum required contribution, including paying the full amount of the impact of the changes, if possible.

Employee contribution rates reflected in the valuations are shown below:

Valuation Date:	Employee Contribution Rate	
	12/31/2015	12/31/2014
<b>Division</b>		
01 - Gnrl Non Un	5.00%	5.00%
10 - Gnrl AFSCME	5.00%	5.00%
11 - Gnrl Dspth	10.00%	10.00%
14 - Cty Mgr	0.00%	0.00%
15 - City Mgr. aft. 7/1/201	5.00%	5.00%
16 - AFSCME after 7/1/2010	5.00%	5.00%
17 - Non-Union after 1/1/20	5.00%	5.00%

The employer may contribute more than the minimum required contributions, as these additional contributions will earn investment income and may result in lower future contribution requirements. **MERS strongly encourages employers to contribute more than the minimum contribution shown above.**

Assuming that experience of the plan meets actuarial assumptions:

- To accelerate to a 100% funding ratio in 10 years, estimated monthly employer contributions for the entire employer would be \$ 6,050, instead of \$ 5,822.
- To accelerate to a 100% funding ratio in 20 years, estimated monthly employer contributions for the entire employer would be \$ 5,845, instead of \$ 5,822.

If you are interested in making additional contributions, please contact MERS and they can assist you with evaluating your options.

### **How and Why Do These Numbers Change?**

In a defined benefit plan contributions vary from one annual actuarial valuation to the next as a result of the following:

- Changes in benefit provisions (see Table 2)
- Changes in actuarial assumptions and methods (see the [Appendix](#))
- Experience of the plan (investment experience and demographic experience); this is the difference between actual experience of the plan and the actuarial assumptions

Actuarial valuations do not affect the ultimate cost of the plan; the benefit payments (current and future) determine the cost of the plan. Actuarial valuations only affect the timing of the contributions into the plan. Because assumptions are for the long term, plan experience will not match the actuarial assumptions in any given year (except by coincidence). Each annual actuarial valuation will adjust the required employer contributions up or down based on the prior year's actual experience.

### **Comments on Asset Smoothing**

The actuarial value of assets, used to determine both your funded ratio and your required employer contribution, is based on a smoothed value of assets (10-year smoothing prior to 2016; 5-year smoothing beginning in 2016). A smoothing method reduces the volatility of the valuation results, which affects your required employer contribution and funded ratio. The smoothed actuarial rate of return for 2015 was 5.21%.

As of December 31, 2015 the actuarial value of assets is 113% of market value. This means that meeting the actuarial assumption in the next few years will require average annual market returns that exceed the 7.75% investment return assumption.

If the December 31, 2015 valuation results were based on market value on that date instead of smoothed funding value: i) the funded percent of your entire municipality would be 113% (instead of 129%); and ii) your total employer contribution requirement for the fiscal year starting July 1, 2017 would be \$ 88,392 (instead of \$ 69,864).

The asset smoothing method is a powerful tool for reducing the volatility of your required employer contributions. **However, if the current 13% difference between the smoothed value and the market value of assets is not made up, the result would be gradual increases in your employer contribution requirement over the next few years (to around the levels described above).**

## Risk Characteristics of Defined Benefit Plans

It is important to understand that retirement plans, by their nature, are exposed to certain risks. While risks cannot be eliminated entirely, they can be mitigated through various strategies. Below are a few examples of risk (this is not an all-inclusive list):

- Economic - investment return, wage inflation, etc.
- Demographic - longevity, disability, retirement, etc.
- Plan Sponsor and Employees - contribution volatility, attract/retain employees, etc.

The MERS Retirement Board adopts certain assumptions and methods to mitigate the economic and demographic risks, and the contribution volatility risks. For example, the investment risk is the largest economic risk and is mitigated by having a balanced portfolio and a clearly defined investment strategy. Demographic risks vary based on the age of the workforce and are mitigated by preparing special studies called experience studies on a regular basis to determine if the assumptions used are reasonable compared to the experience. Risk may be mitigated through a plan design that provides benefits that are sustainable in the long run. An Experience Study is completed every five years to review the assumptions and methods. The next Experience Study will be completed in 2020.

## Alternate Scenarios to Estimate the Potential Volatility of Results ("What If Scenarios")

The calculations in this report are based on assumptions about long-term economic and demographic behavior. These assumptions will never materialize in a given year, except by coincidence. Therefore the results will vary from one year to the next. The volatility of the results depends upon the characteristics of the plan. For example:

- Open divisions that have substantial assets compared to their active employee payroll will have more volatile employer contribution rates due to investment return fluctuations.
- Open divisions that have substantial accrued liability compared to their active employee payroll will have more volatile employer contribution rates due to demographic experience fluctuations.
- Small divisions will have more volatile contribution patterns than larger divisions because statistical fluctuations are relatively larger among small populations.
- Shorter amortization periods result in more volatile contribution patterns.

The analysis in this section is intended to review the potential volatility of the actuarial valuation results. It is important to note that calculations in this report are mathematical estimates based upon assumptions regarding future events, which may or may not materialize. Actuarial calculations can and do vary from one valuation to the next, sometimes significantly depending on the group's size.

Many assumptions are important in determining the required employer contributions.

For example:

- Lower investment returns would result in higher required employer contributions, and vice-versa.

- Smaller than projected pay increases would lower required employer contributions.
- Reductions in the number of active employees would lower required contribution dollars, but would usually increase the contribution rate expressed as a percentage of (the now lower) payroll.
- Retirements at earlier ages than projected would usually increase required employer contributions.
- More non-vested terminations of employment than projected would decrease required contributions.
- More disabilities or survivor (death) benefits than projected would increase required contributions.
- Longer lifetimes after retirement than projected would increase required employer contributions.

In the table below, we show the impact of varying one actuarial assumption: the future annual rate of investment return. Lower investment returns would result in higher required employer contributions, and vice-versa.

The relative impact of each investment return scenario below will vary from year to year, as the participant demographics change. The impact of each scenario should be analyzed for a given year, not from year to year. The results in the table are based on the December 31, 2015 valuation, and are for the municipality in total, not by division. These results do not reflect a 5-year phase in of the impact of the new actuarial assumptions.

	Assumed Future Annual Smoothed Rate of Investment Return			
	Lower Future Annual Returns		Valuation Assumption	Higher Returns
	5.75%	6.75%	7.75%	8.75%
<b>12/31/2015 Valuation Results</b>				
Accrued Liability	\$ 18,304,654	\$ 16,392,864	\$ 14,783,387	\$ 13,426,499
Valuation Assets	\$ 19,018,514	\$ 19,018,514	\$ 19,018,514	\$ 19,018,514
Unfunded Accrued Liability	\$ (713,860)	\$ (2,625,650)	\$ (4,235,127)	\$ (5,592,015)
<b>Funded Ratio</b>	104%	116%	129%	142%
Monthly Normal Cost	\$ 30,936	\$ 23,075	\$ 16,960	\$ 12,205
Monthly Amortization Payment	\$ (6,153)	\$ (25,734)	\$ (45,787)	\$ (64,798)
<b>Total Employer Contribution<sup>1</sup></b>	\$ 26,978	\$ 10,392	\$ 5,822	\$ 3,703

<sup>1</sup> If assets exceed accrued liabilities for a division, the division's amortization payment is negative and is used to reduce the division's employer contribution requirement. If the overfunding credit is larger than the normal cost, the division's full credit is included in the municipality's amortization payment above but the division's total contribution requirement is zero. This can cause the displayed normal cost and amortization payment to not add up to the displayed total employer contribution.

## Six Year Projection Scenarios

The table on the following page illustrates the plan's projected liabilities and computed employer contributions for the next six fiscal years, under the new actuarial assumptions and under three future economic/assumption scenarios. All four projections take into account the past financial losses that will continue to affect the smoothed rate of return for the next four years. Under the 7.75% scenarios, two sets of projections are shown:

- Based on the phase-in over 5 fiscal years (beginning in 2017) of the increased contribution requirements associated with the new actuarial assumptions. This projects your minimum required contribution.
- Based on no phase-in of the increased contribution requirements.

The 7.75% scenarios provide an estimate of computed employer contributions based on current actuarial assumptions, and a projected 7.75% market return. The other two scenarios may be useful if the municipality chooses to budget more conservatively, and make contributions in addition to the minimum requirements. The 6.75% and 5.75% projections provide an indication of the potential required employer contribution if MERS were to realize investment returns of 6.75% and 5.75% over the long-term.

Valuation Year Ending 12/31	Fiscal Year Beginning 7/1	Actuarial Accrued Liability	Valuation Assets	Funded Percentage	Computed Annual Employer Contribution
<b>7.75% Assumed Interest Discount Rate and Future Annual Market Rate of Return</b>					
<b>WITH 5-YEAR PHASE-IN</b>					
2015	2017	\$ 14,783,387	\$ 19,018,514	129%	\$ 64,008
2016	2018	15,177,905	18,958,981	125%	76,740
2017	2019	15,675,317	18,976,798	121%	89,208
2018	2020	16,167,479	18,939,646	117%	104,460
2019	2021	16,663,916	18,867,791	113%	120,756
2020	2022	17,175,696	19,327,149	113%	132,600
<b>NO 5-YEAR PHASE-IN</b>					
2015	2017	\$ 14,783,387	\$ 19,018,514	129%	\$ 69,864
2016	2018	15,177,905	18,958,981	125%	80,712
2017	2019	15,675,317	18,980,069	121%	91,248
2018	2020	16,167,479	18,948,394	117%	104,772
2019	2021	16,663,916	18,880,078	113%	119,484
2020	2022	17,175,696	19,341,555	113%	131,244
<b>6.75% Assumed Interest Discount Rate and Future Annual Market Rate of Return</b>					
<b>NO 5-YEAR PHASE-IN</b>					
2015	2017	\$ 16,392,864	\$ 19,018,514	116%	\$ 124,704
2016	2018	16,825,636	18,778,477	112%	160,896
2017	2019	17,361,169	18,640,711	107%	222,372
2018	2020	17,891,302	18,483,864	103%	260,568
2019	2021	18,425,728	18,319,413	99%	300,576
2020	2022	18,975,620	18,721,077	99%	320,124
<b>5.75% Assumed Interest Discount Rate and Future Annual Market Rate of Return</b>					
<b>NO 5-YEAR PHASE-IN</b>					
2015	2017	\$ 18,304,654	\$ 19,018,514	104%	\$ 323,736
2016	2018	18,781,193	18,597,942	99%	378,048
2017	2019	19,360,486	18,384,228	95%	461,268
2018	2020	19,934,312	18,261,001	92%	520,812
2019	2021	20,512,613	18,140,750	88%	584,916
2020	2022	21,106,741	18,535,960	88%	615,528

## Employer Contribution Details (Without a 5-year Phase-In) For the Fiscal Year Beginning July 1, 2017

Table 1

Division	Amort. Period for Unfund. Liab. <sup>4,5</sup>	Employer Contributions <sup>1</sup>			Blended Employer Contribut. <sup>6</sup>	Employee Contribution Rate	Employee Contribut. Conversion Factor <sup>2</sup>
		Normal Cost	Unfunded Accrued Liability	Total Computed Employer Contribut.			
<b>Percentage of Payroll</b>							
01 - Gnrl Non Un	23	-	-	-	0.00%	5.00%	
10 - Gnrl AFSCME	23	-	-	-	0.00%	5.00%	
11 - Gnrl Dspth	16	-	-	-		10.00%	
14 - Cty Mgr	23	-	-	-	6.54%	0.00%	
15 - City Mgr. aft. 7/1	23	14.53%	-9.58%	4.95%	6.54%	5.00%	0.98%
16 - AFSCME after 7/1/2	23	5.95%	-5.95%	0.00%	0.00%	5.00%	0.79%
17 - Non-Union after 1/	23	6.61%	0.26%	6.87%	0.00%	5.00%	0.86%
<b>Estimated Monthly Contribution<sup>3</sup></b>							
01 - Gnrl Non Un	23	\$ 4,537	\$ (27,015)	\$ 0			
10 - Gnrl AFSCME	23	4,473	(13,312)	0			
11 - Gnrl Dspth	16	0	(3,332)	0			
14 - Cty Mgr	23	0	79	79			
15 - City Mgr. aft. 7/1	23	1,328	(876)	452			
16 - AFSCME after 7/1/2	23	1,531	(1,531)	0			
17 - Non-Union after 1/	23	5,091	200	5,291			
<b>Total Municipality</b>		<b>\$ 16,960</b>	<b>\$ (45,787)</b>	<b>\$ 5,822</b>			
<b>Estimated Annual Contribution<sup>3</sup></b>		<b>\$ 203,520</b>	<b>\$ (549,444)</b>	<b>\$ 69,864</b>			

<sup>1</sup> The above employer contribution requirements are in addition to the employee contributions, if any.

<sup>2</sup> If employee contributions are increased/decreased by 1.00% of pay, the employer contribution requirement will decrease/increase by the Employee Contribution Conversion Factor. The conversion factor is usually under 1%, because employee contributions may be refunded at termination of employment, and not used to fund retirement pensions. Employer contributions will all be used to fund pensions.

<sup>3</sup> For divisions that are open to new hires, estimated contributions are based on projected fiscal year payroll. Actual contributions will be based on actual reported monthly pays, and will be different from the above amounts. For divisions that will have no new hires, invoices will be based on the above dollar amounts which are based on projected fiscal year payroll. See description of Open Divisions and Closed Divisions in the [Appendix](#).

<sup>4</sup> If projected assets exceed projected liabilities as of the beginning of the July 1, 2017 fiscal year, the negative unfunded accrued liability is amortized (spread) over 10 years. This amortization is used to reduce the employer contribution rate. Note that if the overfunding credit is larger than the normal cost, the full credit is shown above but the total contribution requirement is zero. This will cause the displayed normal cost and unfunded accrued liability contributions to not add across.

<sup>5</sup> If the division is closed to new hires, with new hires not covered by MERS Defined Benefit Plan or Hybrid Plan provisions, the amortization period will decrease as follows: Under Amortization Option A, the period will decrease by 2 years each valuation year, until it reaches 6 or 5 years. Then it decreases by 1 year each valuation year until the UAL is paid off. Under Amortization Option B, the period will decrease by 2 years each valuation year, until it reaches 16 or 15 years. Thereafter, the period will reduce by 1 year each valuation year, until the UAL is paid off. This will result in amortization payments that increase faster than the usual 3.75% each year. If the division is closed to new hires, with new hires (and transfers) covered by MERS Defined Benefit Plan or Hybrid Plan provisions, the standard open division amortization period will apply.

<sup>6</sup> For linked divisions, the employer will be invoiced the Total Required Employer Contribution rate shown above for each linked division (a contribution rate for the open division; a contribution dollar for the closed-but-linked division), unless the employer elects to contribute the Blended Employer Contribution rate shown above, by contacting MERS at 800-767-2308.

**Note** that the Employer Contribution Details shown in Table 1 do **not** reflect phase-in over 5 fiscal years (beginning in 2017) of the increased contribution requirements associated with the new actuarial assumptions. The full contribution without phase-in is shown in Table 1 above. The contribution requirements including the 5-year phase-in are shown on page 8.

**Please see the Comments on Asset Smoothing.**

## Benefit Provisions

### Table 2

#### 01 - Gnrl Non Un: Closed to new hires, linked to Division 17

	2015 Valuation	2014 Valuation
<b>Benefit Multiplier:</b>	2.50% Multiplier (80% max)	2.50% Multiplier (80% max)
<b>Normal Retirement Age:</b>	60	60
<b>Vesting:</b>	10 years	10 years
<b>Early Retirement (Unreduced):</b>	50/25 55/15	50/25 55/15
<b>Early Retirement (Reduced):</b>	-	-
<b>Final Average Compensation:</b>	3 years	3 years
<b>Employee Contributions:</b>	5%	5%
<b>Act 88:</b>	Yes (Adopted 2/7/1972)	Yes (Adopted 2/7/1972)

#### 10 - Gnrl AFSCME: Closed to new hires, linked to Division 16

	2015 Valuation	2014 Valuation
<b>Benefit Multiplier:</b>	2.50% Multiplier (80% max)	2.50% Multiplier (80% max)
<b>Normal Retirement Age:</b>	60	60
<b>Vesting:</b>	10 years	10 years
<b>Early Retirement (Unreduced):</b>	50/25 55/15	50/25 55/15
<b>Early Retirement (Reduced):</b>	-	-
<b>Final Average Compensation:</b>	3 years	3 years
<b>Employee Contributions:</b>	5%	5%
<b>Act 88:</b>	Yes (Adopted 2/7/1972)	Yes (Adopted 2/7/1972)

#### 11 - Gnrl Dspth: Closed to new hires

	2015 Valuation	2014 Valuation
<b>Benefit Multiplier:</b>	2.25% Multiplier (80% max)	2.25% Multiplier (80% max)
<b>Normal Retirement Age:</b>	60	60
<b>Vesting:</b>	10 years	10 years
<b>Early Retirement (Unreduced):</b>	55/15 20 and Out	55/15 20 and Out
<b>Early Retirement (Reduced):</b>	-	-
<b>Final Average Compensation:</b>	3 years	3 years
<b>Employee Contributions:</b>	10%	10%
<b>Act 88:</b>	Yes (Adopted 2/7/1972)	Yes (Adopted 2/7/1972)

Table 2 (continued)

**14 - Cty Mgr: Closed to new hires, linked to Division 15**

	<b>2015 Valuation</b>	<b>2014 Valuation</b>
<b>Benefit Multiplier:</b>	2.50% Multiplier (80% max)	2.50% Multiplier (80% max)
<b>Normal Retirement Age:</b>	60	60
<b>Vesting:</b>	8 years	8 years
<b>Early Retirement (Unreduced):</b>	55/15	55/15
<b>Early Retirement (Reduced):</b>	50/25	50/25
<b>Final Average Compensation:</b>	3 years	3 years
<b>COLA for Future Retirees:</b>	2.50% (Non-Compound)	2.50% (Non-Compound)
<b>Employee Contributions:</b>	0%	0%
<b>RS50% Percentage:</b>	50%	50%
<b>Act 88:</b>	Yes (Adopted 10/1/2005)	Yes (Adopted 10/1/2005)

**15 - City Mgr. aft. 7/1/2012: Open Division, linked to Division 14**

	<b>2015 Valuation</b>	<b>2014 Valuation</b>
<b>Benefit Multiplier:</b>	2.25% Multiplier (80% max)	2.25% Multiplier (80% max)
<b>Normal Retirement Age:</b>	60	60
<b>Vesting:</b>	8 years	8 years
<b>Early Retirement (Unreduced):</b>	-	-
<b>Early Retirement (Reduced):</b>	50/25	50/25
	55/15	55/15
<b>Final Average Compensation:</b>	3 years	3 years
<b>Employee Contributions:</b>	5%	5%
<b>RS50% Percentage:</b>	50%	50%
<b>Act 88:</b>	Yes (Adopted 10/1/2005)	Yes (Adopted 10/1/2005)

**16 - AFSCME after 7/1/2010: Open Division, linked to Division 10**

	<b>2015 Valuation</b>	<b>2014 Valuation</b>
<b>Benefit Multiplier:</b>	2.00% Multiplier (no max)	2.00% Multiplier (no max)
<b>Normal Retirement Age:</b>	60	60
<b>Vesting:</b>	10 years	10 years
<b>Early Retirement (Unreduced):</b>	50/25	50/25
	55/15	55/15
<b>Early Retirement (Reduced):</b>	-	-
<b>Final Average Compensation:</b>	3 years	3 years
<b>Employee Contributions:</b>	5%	5%
<b>Act 88:</b>	Yes (Adopted 2/7/1972)	Yes (Adopted 2/7/1972)

**Table 2** (continued)**17 - Non-Union after 1/1/2013: Open Division, linked to Division 01**

	<b>2015 Valuation</b>	<b>2014 Valuation</b>
<b>Benefit Multiplier:</b>	2.00% Multiplier (no max)	2.00% Multiplier (no max)
<b>Normal Retirement Age:</b>	60	60
<b>Vesting:</b>	10 years	10 years
<b>Early Retirement (Unreduced):</b>	55/25	55/25
<b>Early Retirement (Reduced):</b>	50/25	50/25
	55/15	55/15
<b>Final Average Compensation:</b>	3 years	3 years
<b>Employee Contributions:</b>	5%	5%
<b>Act 88:</b>	Yes (Adopted 2/7/1972)	Yes (Adopted 2/7/1972)

## Participant Summary

**Table 3**

Division	2015 Valuation		2014 Valuation		2015 Valuation		
	Number	Annual Payroll <sup>1</sup>	Number	Annual Payroll <sup>1</sup>	Average Age	Average Benefit Service <sup>2</sup>	Average Eligibility Service <sup>2</sup>
01 - Gnrl Non Un							
Active Employees	13	\$ 869,354	14	\$ 891,907	54.0	17.6	17.6
Vested Former Employees	10	110,673	10	110,673	47.4	9.2	13.8
Retirees and Beneficiaries	29	388,165	28	365,533	74.7		
10 - Gnrl AFSCME							
Active Employees	15	\$ 691,487	17	\$ 769,034	45.8	12.6	12.6
Vested Former Employees	1	10,884	1	10,884	39.4	11.1	11.1
Retirees and Beneficiaries	23	382,404	23	382,412	68.6		
11 - Gnrl Dspth							
Active Employees	0	\$ 0	0	\$ 0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Vested Former Employees	5	26,082	5	26,082	39.8	5.3	11.3
Retirees and Beneficiaries	2	21,489	2	21,489	72.9		
14 - Cty Mgr							
Active Employees	0	\$ 0	0	\$ 0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Vested Former Employees	0	0	0	0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Retirees and Beneficiaries	1	46,596	1	45,537	63.8		
15 - City Mgr. aft. 7/1/2							
Active Employees	1	\$ 100,014	1	\$ 93,644	63.4	3.4	8.8
Vested Former Employees	0	0	0	0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Retirees and Beneficiaries	0	0	0	0	0.0		
16 - AFSCME after 7/1/201							
Active Employees	6	\$ 205,852	3	\$ 98,634	34.5	1.1	1.1
Vested Former Employees	3	9,483	3	9,483	43.4	4.3	12.0
Retirees and Beneficiaries	0	0	0	0	0.0		
17 - Non-Union after 1/1/							
Active Employees	10	\$ 573,830	5	\$ 262,838	41.6	1.9	5.9
Vested Former Employees	0	0	0	0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Retirees and Beneficiaries	0	0	0	0	0.0		
<b>Total Municipality</b>							
<b>Active Employees</b>	<b>45</b>	<b>\$ 2,440,537</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>\$ 2,116,057</b>	<b>46.1</b>	<b>9.9</b>	<b>10.9</b>
<b>Vested Former Employees</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>157,122</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>157,122</b>	<b>44.4</b>	<b>7.5</b>	<b>12.7</b>
<b>Retirees and Beneficiaries</b>	<b>55</b>	<b>838,654</b>	<b>54</b>	<b>814,971</b>	<b>71.9</b>		
<b>Total Participants</b>	<b>119</b>		<b>113</b>				

<sup>1</sup> Annual payroll for active employees; annual deferred benefits payable for vested former employees; annual benefits being paid for retirees and beneficiaries.

<sup>2</sup> Description can be found under Miscellaneous and Technical Assumptions in the [Appendix](#).

## Reported Assets (Market Value)

**Table 4**

Division	2015 Valuation		2014 Valuation	
	Employer and Retiree <sup>1</sup>	Employee <sup>2</sup>	Employer and Retiree <sup>1</sup>	Employee <sup>2</sup>
01 - Gnrl Non Un	\$ 8,101,414	\$ 883,962	\$ 8,599,294	\$ 871,678
10 - Gnrl AFSCME	5,836,582	416,145	6,292,285	410,369
11 - Gnrl Dspch	437,042	93,232	468,625	92,630
14 - Cty Mgr	514,257	0	569,036	0
15 - City Mgr. aft. 7/1/2012	125,084	16,336	127,669	11,262
16 - AFSCME after 7/1/2010	180,439	48,430	184,746	39,920
17 - Non-Union after 1/1/2013	49,854	47,984	35,262	27,712
<b>Municipality Total</b>	<b>\$ 15,244,672</b>	<b>\$ 1,506,089</b>	<b>\$ 16,276,917</b>	<b>\$ 1,453,571</b>
<b>Combined Reserves</b>	<b>\$ 16,750,761</b>		<b>\$ 17,730,488</b>	

<sup>1</sup> Reserve for Employer Contributions and Benefit Payments

<sup>2</sup> Reserve for Employee Contributions

The December 31, 2015 valuation assets are equal to 1.135382 times the reported market value of assets (compared to 1.059937 as of December 31, 2014). The derivation of valuation assets is described, and detailed calculations of valuation assets are shown, in the [Appendix](#).

## Flow of Valuation Assets

**Table 5**

Year Ended 12/31	Employer Contributions		Employee Contributions	Investment Income	Benefit Payments	Employee Contribution Refunds	Net Transfers	Valuation Asset Balance
	Required	Additional						
2005	\$ 19,024		\$ 250,465	\$ 976,590	\$ (569,556)	\$ (24,812)	\$ (299,496)	\$ 16,030,936
2006	44,478		118,994	1,284,635	(628,348)	(35,205)	1	16,815,491
2007	26,695		123,481	1,363,331	(789,419)	(84,876)	0	17,454,703
2008	0		125,096	722,207	(771,554)	(9,105)	12,177	17,533,524
2009	0		121,435	679,741	(733,569)	(24,365)	0	17,576,766
2010	222		102,227	872,649	(732,612)	(23,580)	0	17,795,672
2011	222	\$ 0	99,202	857,598	(739,837)	(2,812)	0	18,010,045
2012	1,963	0	99,414	771,282	(804,123)	(3,964)	0	18,074,617
2013	0	0	108,988	1,049,864	(786,836)	(2,697)	17,585	18,461,521
2014	0	0	109,007	1,037,595	(813,912)	(1,011)	0	18,793,200
2015	16,097	0	118,024	905,580	(813,225)	(1,162)	0	19,018,514

**Notes:**

Transfers in and out are usually related to the transfer of participants between municipalities, and to employer and employee payments for service credit purchases (if any) that the governing body has approved.

Additional employer contributions, if any, are shown separately starting in 2011. Prior to 2011, additional contributions are combined with the required employer contributions.

In the actuarial valuation additional employer contributions are combined with required contributions and used to reduce computed future required employer contributions.

The investment income column reflects the recognized investment income based on the smoothed value of assets. It does not reflect the market value investment return in any given year.

## Actuarial Accrued Liabilities and Valuation Assets As of December 31, 2015

Table 6

Division	Actuarial Accrued Liability	Valuation Assets <sup>1</sup>	Percent Funded	Unfunded (Overfunded) Accrued Liabilities
01 - Gnrl Non Un				
Active Employees	\$ 3,556,548	\$ 6,015,333	169.1%	\$ (2,458,785)
Vested Former Employees	562,695	562,695	100.0%	0
Retirees And Beneficiaries	3,524,050	3,524,050	100.0%	0
Pending Refunds	<u>99,756</u>	<u>99,756</u>	100.0%	<u>0</u>
Total	<b>\$ 7,743,049</b>	<b>\$ 10,201,834</b>	<b>131.8%</b>	<b>\$ (2,458,785)</b>
10 - Gnrl AFSCME				
Active Employees	\$ 2,012,925	\$ 3,258,192	161.9%	\$ (1,245,267)
Vested Former Employees	24,191	24,191	100.0%	0
Retirees And Beneficiaries	3,806,074	3,806,074	100.0%	0
Pending Refunds	<u>10,777</u>	<u>10,777</u>	100.0%	<u>0</u>
Total	<b>\$ 5,853,967</b>	<b>\$ 7,099,234</b>	<b>121.3%</b>	<b>\$ (1,245,267)</b>
11 - Gnrl Dspch				
Active Employees	\$ 0	\$ 292,065	0.0%	\$ (292,065)
Vested Former Employees	101,550	101,550	100.0%	0
Retirees And Beneficiaries	191,004	191,004	100.0%	0
Pending Refunds	<u>17,445</u>	<u>17,445</u>	100.0%	<u>0</u>
Total	<b>\$ 309,999</b>	<b>\$ 602,064</b>	<b>194.2%</b>	<b>\$ (292,065)</b>
14 - Cty Mgr				
Active Employees	\$ 0	\$ 0	0.0%	\$ 0
Vested Former Employees	0	0	0.0%	0
Retirees And Beneficiaries	596,626	583,878	97.9%	12,748
Pending Refunds	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>	0.0%	<u>0</u>
Total	<b>\$ 596,626</b>	<b>\$ 583,878</b>	<b>97.9%</b>	<b>\$ 12,748</b>
15 - City Mgr. aft. 7/1/2012				
Active Employees	\$ 63,018	\$ 160,566	254.8%	\$ (97,548)
Vested Former Employees	0	0	0.0%	0
Retirees And Beneficiaries	0	0	0.0%	0
Pending Refunds	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>	0.0%	<u>0</u>
Total	<b>\$ 63,018</b>	<b>\$ 160,566</b>	<b>254.8%</b>	<b>\$ (97,548)</b>
16 - AFSCME after 7/1/2010				
Active Employees	\$ 28,876	\$ 219,738	761.0%	\$ (190,862)
Vested Former Employees	39,759	39,759	100.0%	0
Retirees And Beneficiaries	0	0	0.0%	0
Pending Refunds	<u>357</u>	<u>357</u>	100.0%	<u>0</u>
Total	<b>\$ 68,992</b>	<b>\$ 259,854</b>	<b>376.6%</b>	<b>\$ (190,862)</b>

**Table 6 (continued)**

<b>Division</b>	<b>Actuarial Accrued Liability</b>	<b>Valuation Assets<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>Percent Funded</b>	<b>Unfunded (Overfunded) Accrued Liabilities</b>
<b>17 - Non-Union after 1/1/2013</b>				
Active Employees	\$ 147,098	\$ 110,446	75.1%	\$ 36,652
Vested Former Employees	0	0	0.0%	0
Retirees And Beneficiaries	0	0	0.0%	0
Pending Refunds	<u>638</u>	<u>638</u>	100.0%	<u>0</u>
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 147,736</b>	<b>\$ 111,084</b>	<b>75.2%</b>	<b>\$ 36,652</b>
<b>Total Municipality</b>				
<b>Active Employees</b>	<b>\$ 5,808,465</b>	<b>\$ 10,056,340</b>	<b>173.1%</b>	<b>\$ (4,247,875)</b>
<b>Vested Former Employees</b>	<b>728,195</b>	<b>728,195</b>	<b>100.0%</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Retirees and Beneficiaries</b>	<b>8,117,754</b>	<b>8,105,006</b>	<b>99.8%</b>	<b>12,748</b>
<b>Pending Refunds</b>	<b><u>128,973</u></b>	<b><u>128,973</u></b>	<b>100.0%</b>	<b><u>0</u></b>
<b>Total Participants</b>	<b>\$ 14,783,387</b>	<b>\$ 19,018,514</b>	<b>128.6%</b>	<b>\$ (4,235,127)</b>
The following results show the combined accrued liabilities and assets for each set of linked divisions. These results are already included in the table above.				
<b>Linked Divisions 17, 01</b>				
Active Employees	\$ 3,703,646	\$ 6,125,779	165.4%	\$ (2,422,133)
Vested Former Employees	562,695	562,695	100.0%	0
Retirees and Beneficiaries	3,524,050	3,524,050	100.0%	0
Pending Refunds	<u>100,394</u>	<u>100,394</u>	100.0%	<u>0</u>
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 7,890,785</b>	<b>\$ 10,312,918</b>	<b>130.7%</b>	<b>\$ (2,422,133)</b>
<b>Linked Divisions 16, 10</b>				
Active Employees	\$ 2,041,801	\$ 3,477,930	170.3%	\$ (1,436,129)
Vested Former Employees	63,950	63,950	100.0%	0
Retirees and Beneficiaries	3,806,074	3,806,074	100.0%	0
Pending Refunds	<u>11,134</u>	<u>11,134</u>	100.0%	<u>0</u>
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 5,922,959</b>	<b>\$ 7,359,088</b>	<b>124.2%</b>	<b>\$ (1,436,129)</b>
<b>Linked Divisions 15, 14</b>				
Active Employees	\$ 63,018	\$ 160,566	254.8%	\$ (97,548)
Vested Former Employees	0	0	0.0%	0
Retirees and Beneficiaries	596,626	583,878	97.9%	12,748
Pending Refunds	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>	0.0%	<u>0</u>
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 659,644</b>	<b>\$ 744,444</b>	<b>112.9%</b>	<b>\$ (84,800)</b>

<sup>1</sup> Includes both employer and employee assets.

**Please see the Comments on Asset Smoothing.**

See the MERS Fiscal Responsibility Policy on the MERS website at:

[http://www.mersofmich.com/Portals/0/Assets/PageResources/MERS/PlanDocument/Pension/MERSPlanDocument\\_Section46.pdf](http://www.mersofmich.com/Portals/0/Assets/PageResources/MERS/PlanDocument/Pension/MERSPlanDocument_Section46.pdf).

## Actuarial Accrued Liabilities - Comparative Schedule

**Table 7**

Valuation Date December 31	Actuarial Accrued Liability	Valuation Assets	Percent Funded	Unfunded (Overfunded) Accrued Liabilities
2001	\$ 8,991,957	\$ 14,367,886	160%	\$ (5,375,929)
2002	9,556,377	14,404,059	151%	(4,847,682)
2003	9,888,040	15,107,484	153%	(5,219,444)
2004	10,303,544	15,678,721	152%	(5,375,177)
2005	10,301,827	16,030,936	156%	(5,729,109)
2006	11,271,094	16,815,491	149%	(5,544,397)
2007	11,905,095	17,454,703	147%	(5,549,608)
2008	11,975,264	17,533,524	146%	(5,558,260)
2009	11,686,193	17,576,766	150%	(5,890,573)
2010	11,787,614	17,795,672	151%	(6,008,058)
2011	12,209,422	18,010,045	148%	(5,800,623)
2012	12,460,118	18,074,617	145%	(5,614,499)
2013	12,834,271	18,461,521	144%	(5,627,250)
2014	13,407,385	18,793,200	140%	(5,385,815)
2015	14,783,387	19,018,514	129%	(4,235,127)

Notes: Actuarial assumptions were revised for the 2004, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011, 2012 and 2015 actuarial valuations.

## Division 01 - Gnrl Non Un

Table 8-01: Actuarial Accrued Liabilities - Comparative Schedule

Valuation Date December 31	Actuarial Accrued Liability	Valuation Assets	Percent Funded	Unfunded (Overfunded) Accrued Liabilities
2005	\$ 5,209,602	\$ 9,371,675	180%	\$ (4,162,073)
2006	5,801,217	10,029,528	173%	(4,228,311)
2007	6,391,791	9,293,604	145%	(2,901,813)
2008	6,210,247	9,335,311	150%	(3,125,064)
2009	6,268,919	9,359,881	149%	(3,090,962)
2010	6,362,431	9,488,714	149%	(3,126,283)
2011	6,498,651	9,614,038	148%	(3,115,387)
2012	6,401,591	9,588,005	150%	(3,186,414)
2013	6,660,607	9,800,537	147%	(3,139,930)
2014	6,928,425	10,038,634	145%	(3,110,209)
2015	7,743,049	10,201,834	132%	(2,458,785)

Notes: Actuarial assumptions were revised for the 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011, 2012 and 2015 actuarial valuations.

Table 9-01: Computed Employer Contributions - Comparative Schedule

Valuation Date December 31	Active Employees		Computed Employer Contribution <sup>1</sup>	Employee Contribution Rate <sup>2</sup>
	Number	Annual Payroll		
2005	24	\$ 1,173,465	0.00%	4.87%
2006	21	1,079,982	0.00%	5.00%
2007	24	1,357,033	0.00%	5.00%
2008	20	1,132,044	0.00%	5.00%
2009	18	1,075,646	0.00%	5.00%
2010	19	1,093,543	0.00%	5.00%
2011	19	1,028,607	0.00%	5.00%
2012	16	924,909	\$ 0	5.00%
2013	15	904,114	\$ 0	5.00%
2014	14	891,907	\$ 0	5.00%
2015	13	869,354	\$ 0	5.00%

<sup>1</sup> For open divisions, a percent of pay contribution is shown. For closed divisions, a monthly dollar contribution is shown.

<sup>2</sup> For each valuation year, the computed employer contribution is based on the employee rate. If the employee rate changes during the applicable fiscal year, the computed employer contribution will be adjusted.

**Note:** The contributions shown in Table 9 for the 12/31/2015 valuation do **not** reflect phase-in over 5 fiscal years (beginning in 2017) of the increased contribution requirements associated with the new actuarial assumptions. The full contribution without phase-in is shown in Table 9 above. The contribution requirements including the 5-year phase-in are shown on page 8.

See the Benefit Provision History on page 34 for past benefit provision changes.

## Division 10 - Gnrl AFSCME

Table 8-10: Actuarial Accrued Liabilities - Comparative Schedule

Valuation Date December 31	Actuarial Accrued Liability	Valuation Assets	Percent Funded	Unfunded (Overfunded) Accrued Liabilities
2005	\$ 4,485,307	\$ 6,214,476	139%	\$ (1,729,169)
2006	4,809,149	6,273,360	130%	(1,464,211)
2007	4,844,654	7,136,997	147%	(2,292,343)
2008	4,986,779	7,122,028	143%	(2,135,249)
2009	4,626,027	7,093,079	153%	(2,467,052)
2010	4,729,947	7,138,749	151%	(2,408,802)
2011	4,989,033	7,188,356	144%	(2,199,323)
2012	5,203,440	7,010,389	135%	(1,806,949)
2013	5,213,584	7,058,618	135%	(1,845,034)
2014	5,467,240	7,104,391	130%	(1,637,151)
2015	5,853,967	7,099,234	121%	(1,245,267)

Notes: Actuarial assumptions were revised for the 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011, 2012 and 2015 actuarial valuations.

Table 9-10: Computed Employer Contributions - Comparative Schedule

Valuation Date December 31	Active Employees		Computed Employer Contribution <sup>1</sup>	Employee Contribution Rate <sup>2</sup>
	Number	Annual Payroll		
2005	30	\$ 1,281,833	0.00%	4.85%
2006	27	949,517	0.00%	5.00%
2007	26	893,285	0.00%	5.00%
2008	26	986,554	0.00%	5.00%
2009	24	926,113	0.00%	5.00%
2010	23	895,843	0.00%	5.00%
2011	22	876,718	0.00%	5.00%
2012	22	906,353	\$ 0	5.00%
2013	17	726,722	\$ 0	5.00%
2014	17	769,034	\$ 0	5.00%
2015	15	691,487	\$ 0	5.00%

<sup>1</sup> For open divisions, a percent of pay contribution is shown. For closed divisions, a monthly dollar contribution is shown.

<sup>2</sup> For each valuation year, the computed employer contribution is based on the employee rate. If the employee rate changes during the applicable fiscal year, the computed employer contribution will be adjusted.

**Note:** The contributions shown in Table 9 for the 12/31/2015 valuation do **not** reflect phase-in over 5 fiscal years (beginning in 2017) of the increased contribution requirements associated with the new actuarial assumptions. The full contribution without phase-in is shown in Table 9 above. The contribution requirements including the 5-year phase-in are shown on page 8.

See the Benefit Provision History on page 34 for past benefit provision changes.

## Division 11 - Gnrl Dsptch

### Table 8-11: Actuarial Accrued Liabilities - Comparative Schedule

Valuation Date December 31	Actuarial Accrued Liability	Valuation Assets	Percent Funded	Unfunded (Overfunded) Accrued Liabilities
2005	\$ 329,337	\$ 313,261	95%	\$ 16,076
2006	342,305	339,156	99%	3,149
2007	346,651	519,539	150%	(172,888)
2008	384,305	534,957	139%	(150,652)
2009	392,310	553,574	141%	(161,264)
2010	286,648	563,404	197%	(276,756)
2011	285,891	568,828	199%	(282,937)
2012	285,326	571,870	200%	(286,544)
2013	285,030	583,516	205%	(298,486)
2014	285,182	594,895	209%	(309,713)
2015	309,999	602,064	194%	(292,065)

Notes: Actuarial assumptions were revised for the 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011, 2012 and 2015 actuarial valuations.

### Table 9-11: Computed Employer Contributions - Comparative Schedule

Valuation Date December 31	Active Employees		Computed Employer Contribution <sup>1</sup>	Employee Contribution Rate <sup>2</sup>
	Number	Annual Payroll		
2005	6	\$ 202,979	7.37%	4.84%
2006	3	113,324	7.34%	4.85%
2007	4	153,018	0.00%	10.00%
2008	4	164,647	0.00%	10.00%
2009	4	175,197	0.00%	10.00%
2010	0	0	\$ 0	0.00%
2011	0	0	\$ 0	0.00%
2012	0	0	\$ 0	0.00%
2013	0	0	\$ 0	0.00%
2014	0	0	\$ 0	0.00%
2015	0	0	\$ 0	0.00%

<sup>1</sup> For open divisions, a percent of pay contribution is shown. For closed divisions, a monthly dollar contribution is shown.

<sup>2</sup> For each valuation year, the computed employer contribution is based on the employee rate. If the employee rate changes during the applicable fiscal year, the computed employer contribution will be adjusted.

**Note:** The contributions shown in Table 9 for the 12/31/2015 valuation do **not** reflect phase-in over 5 fiscal years (beginning in 2017) of the increased contribution requirements associated with the new actuarial assumptions. The full contribution without phase-in is shown in Table 9 above. The contribution requirements including the 5-year phase-in are shown on page 8.

See the Benefit Provision History on page 34 for past benefit provision changes.

## Division 14 - Cty Mgr

Table 8-14: Actuarial Accrued Liabilities - Comparative Schedule

Valuation Date December 31	Actuarial Accrued Liability	Valuation Assets	Percent Funded	Unfunded (Overfunded) Accrued Liabilities
2005	\$ 277,581	\$ 131,524	47%	\$ 146,057
2006	318,423	173,447	54%	144,976
2007	321,999	504,563	157%	(182,564)
2008	393,933	541,228	137%	(147,295)
2009	398,937	570,232	143%	(171,295)
2010	408,588	604,805	148%	(196,217)
2011	435,847	638,823	147%	(202,976)
2012	561,182	624,994	111%	(63,812)
2013	564,852	614,843	109%	(49,991)
2014	566,407	603,142	107%	(36,735)
2015	596,626	583,878	98%	12,748

Notes: Actuarial assumptions were revised for the 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011, 2012 and 2015 actuarial valuations.

Table 9-14: Computed Employer Contributions - Comparative Schedule

Valuation Date December 31	Active Employees		Computed Employer Contribution <sup>1</sup>	Employee Contribution Rate <sup>2</sup>
	Number	Annual Payroll		
2005	1	\$ 103,064	22.88%	0.00%
2006	1	107,261	22.71%	0.00%
2007	1	98,574	0.00%	0.00%
2008	1	110,579	0.45%	0.00%
2009	1	112,198	0.00%	0.00%
2010	1	99,653	0.00%	0.00%
2011	1	106,212	0.00%	0.00%
2012	0	0	\$ 0	0.00%
2013	0	0	\$ 0	0.00%
2014	0	0	\$ 0	0.00%
2015	0	0	\$ 79	0.00%

<sup>1</sup> For open divisions, a percent of pay contribution is shown. For closed divisions, a monthly dollar contribution is shown.

<sup>2</sup> For each valuation year, the computed employer contribution is based on the employee rate. If the employee rate changes during the applicable fiscal year, the computed employer contribution will be adjusted.

**Note:** The contributions shown in Table 9 for the 12/31/2015 valuation do **not** reflect phase-in over 5 fiscal years (beginning in 2017) of the increased contribution requirements associated with the new actuarial assumptions. The full contribution without phase-in is shown in Table 9 above. The contribution requirements including the 5-year phase-in are shown on page 8.

See the Benefit Provision History on page 34 for past benefit provision changes.

## Division 15 - City Mgr. aft. 7/1/2012

### Table 8-15: Actuarial Accrued Liabilities - Comparative Schedule

Valuation Date December 31	Actuarial Accrued Liability	Valuation Assets	Percent Funded	Unfunded (Overfunded) Accrued Liabilities
2012	\$ (967)	\$ 121,181	0%	\$ (122,148)
2013	16,596	134,205	809%	(117,609)
2014	36,606	147,258	402%	(110,652)
2015	63,018	160,566	255%	(97,548)

Notes: Actuarial assumptions were revised for the 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011, 2012 and 2015 actuarial valuations.

### Table 9-15: Computed Employer Contributions - Comparative Schedule

Valuation Date December 31	Active Employees		Computed Employer Contribution <sup>1</sup>	Employee Contribution Rate <sup>2</sup>
	Number	Annual Payroll		
2012	1	\$ 90,619	0.00%	5.00%
2013	1	93,500	0.00%	5.00%
2014	1	93,644	0.85%	5.00%
2015	1	100,014	4.95%	5.00%

<sup>1</sup> For open divisions, a percent of pay contribution is shown. For closed divisions, a monthly dollar contribution is shown.

<sup>2</sup> For each valuation year, the computed employer contribution is based on the employee rate. If the employee rate changes during the applicable fiscal year, the computed employer contribution will be adjusted.

**Note:** The contributions shown in Table 9 for the 12/31/2015 valuation do **not** reflect phase-in over 5 fiscal years (beginning in 2017) of the increased contribution requirements associated with the new actuarial assumptions. The full contribution without phase-in is shown in Table 9 above. The contribution requirements including the 5-year phase-in are shown on page 8.

See the Benefit Provision History on page 34 for past benefit provision changes.

## Division 16 - AFSCME after 7/1/2010

**Table 8-16: Actuarial Accrued Liabilities - Comparative Schedule**

Valuation Date December 31	Actuarial Accrued Liability	Valuation Assets	Percent Funded	Unfunded (Overfunded) Accrued Liabilities
2012	\$ 0	\$ 153,232	0%	\$ (153,232)
2013	53,995	219,375	406%	(165,380)
2014	46,437	238,132	513%	(191,695)
2015	68,992	259,854	377%	(190,862)

Notes: Actuarial assumptions were revised for the 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011, 2012 and 2015 actuarial valuations.

**Table 9-16: Computed Employer Contributions - Comparative Schedule**

Valuation Date December 31	Active Employees		Computed Employer Contribution <sup>1</sup>	Employee Contribution Rate <sup>2</sup>
	Number	Annual Payroll		
2012	0	\$ 0	0.00%	0.00%
2013	3	104,597	0.00%	5.00%
2014	3	98,634	0.00%	5.00%
2015	6	205,852	0.00%	5.00%

<sup>1</sup> For open divisions, a percent of pay contribution is shown. For closed divisions, a monthly dollar contribution is shown.

<sup>2</sup> For each valuation year, the computed employer contribution is based on the employee rate. If the employee rate changes during the applicable fiscal year, the computed employer contribution will be adjusted.

**Note:** The contributions shown in Table 9 for the 12/31/2015 valuation do **not** reflect phase-in over 5 fiscal years (beginning in 2017) of the increased contribution requirements associated with the new actuarial assumptions. The full contribution without phase-in is shown in Table 9 above. The contribution requirements including the 5-year phase-in are shown on page 8.

See the Benefit Provision History on page 34 for past benefit provision changes.

## Division 17 - Non-Union after 1/1/2013

**Table 8-17: Actuarial Accrued Liabilities - Comparative Schedule**

Valuation Date December 31	Actuarial Accrued Liability	Valuation Assets	Percent Funded	Unfunded (Overfunded) Accrued Liabilities
2012	\$ 9,546	\$ 4,946	52%	\$ 4,600
2013	39,607	50,427	127%	(10,820)
2014	77,088	66,748	87%	10,340
2015	147,736	111,084	75%	36,652

Notes: Actuarial assumptions were revised for the 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011, 2012 and 2015 actuarial valuations.

**Table 9-17: Computed Employer Contributions - Comparative Schedule**

Valuation Date December 31	Active Employees		Computed Employer Contribution <sup>1</sup>	Employee Contribution Rate <sup>2</sup>
	Number	Annual Payroll		
2012	1	\$ 24,723	7.37%	5.00%
2013	6	281,732	6.13%	5.00%
2014	5	262,838	7.49%	5.00%
2015	10	573,830	6.87%	5.00%

<sup>1</sup> For open divisions, a percent of pay contribution is shown. For closed divisions, a monthly dollar contribution is shown.

<sup>2</sup> For each valuation year, the computed employer contribution is based on the employee rate. If the employee rate changes during the applicable fiscal year, the computed employer contribution will be adjusted.

**Note:** The contributions shown in Table 9 for the 12/31/2015 valuation do **not** reflect phase-in over 5 fiscal years (beginning in 2017) of the increased contribution requirements associated with the new actuarial assumptions. The full contribution without phase-in is shown in Table 9 above. The contribution requirements including the 5-year phase-in are shown on page 8.

See the Benefit Provision History on page 34 for past benefit provision changes.

## GASB 68 Information

---

The following information has been prepared to provide some of the information necessary to complete GASB Statement No. 68 disclosures. Statement 68 is effective for fiscal years beginning after June 15, 2014. Additional resources, including an Implementation Guide, are available at [www.mersofmich.com](http://www.mersofmich.com).

Actuarial Valuation Date:	12/31/2015
Measurement Date of Total Pension Liability (TPL):	12/31/2015

At 12/31/2015, the following employees were covered by the benefit terms:

Inactive employees or beneficiaries currently receiving benefits:	55
Inactive employees entitled to but not yet receiving benefits:	19
Active employees:	<u>45</u>
	119

Total Pension Liability as of 12/31/2014 measurement date:	\$ 13,093,173
Total Pension Liability as of 12/31/2015 measurement date:	\$ 14,421,423
Service Cost for the year ending on the 12/31/2015 measurement date:	\$ 297,939

Change in the Total Pension Liability due to:

- Benefit changes <sup>1</sup> :	\$ 0
- Differences between expected and actual experience <sup>2</sup> :	\$ 27,391
- Changes in assumptions <sup>2</sup> :	\$ 758,423

<sup>1</sup> A change in liability due to benefit changes is immediately recognized when calculating pension expense for the year.

<sup>2</sup> Changes in liability due to differences between actual and expected experience, and changes in assumptions, are recognized in pension expense over the average remaining service lives of all employees.

Average expected remaining service lives of all employees (active and inactive):	3
Covered employee payroll: (Needed for Required Supplementary Information)	\$ 2,440,537

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to changes in the discount rate:

	1% Decrease (7.00%)	Current Discount Rate (8.00%)	1% Increase (9.00%)
Change in Net Pension Liability as of 12/31/2015:	\$ 1,543,239	-	\$ (1,298,682)

Note: The current discount rate shown for GASB 68 purposes is higher than the MERS assumed rate of return. This is because for GASB 68 purposes, the discount rate must be gross of administrative expenses, whereas for funding purposes it is net of administrative expenses.

## Benefit Provision History

The following benefit provision history is provided by MERS. Any corrections to this history or discrepancies between this information and information displayed elsewhere in the valuation report should be reported to MERS. All provisions are listed by date of adoption.

### 01 - Gnrl Non Un

1/1/2013	Day of work defined as 8 Hours a Day for All employees.
4/1/2006	Benefit B-4 (80% max)
4/1/2006	Member Contribution Rate 5.00%
9/1/2000	Temporary Benefit B-4 (80% max) (09/01/2000 - 12/03/2000)
1/1/1999	Benefit F50 (With 25 Years of Service)
1/1/1994	Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation)
1/1/1990	Benefit B-3 (80% max)
3/1/1985	Benefit F55 (With 15 Years of Service)
2/7/1972	Covered by Act 88
6/1/1967	Benefit C-1 (Old)
5/1/1946	Benefit FAC-5 (5 Year Final Average Compensation)
5/1/1946	10 Year Vesting
5/1/1946	Benefit C (Old)
5/1/1946	Member Contribution Rate 3.00% Under \$4,200.00 - Then 5.00%
5/1/1946	Fiscal Month - July

### 10 - Gnrl AFSCME

1/1/2006	Benefit B-4 (80% max)
1/1/2006	Member Contribution Rate 5.00%
9/1/2000	Temporary Benefit B-4 (80% max) (09/01/2000 - 12/03/2000)
1/1/1999	Benefit F50 (With 25 Years of Service)
7/1/1991	Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation)
1/1/1990	Benefit FAC-5 (5 Year Final Average Compensation)
1/1/1990	10 Year Vesting
1/1/1990	Benefit B-3 (80% max)
1/1/1990	Member Contribution Rate 3.00% Under \$4,200.00 - Then 5.00%
1/1/1985	Benefit F55 (With 15 Years of Service)
2/7/1972	Covered by Act 88
5/1/1946	Fiscal Month - July

### 11 - Gnrl Dspch

5/1/2007	Member Contribution Rate 10.00%
1/1/2000	Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation)
1/1/1999	20 Years & Out
7/1/1991	Benefit B-3 (80% max)
7/1/1991	Member Contribution Rate 3.00% Under \$4,200.00 - Then 5.00%
7/1/1990	Benefit FAC-5 (5 Year Final Average Compensation)
7/1/1990	10 Year Vesting
7/1/1990	2.25% Multiplier (no max)
10/1/1985	Benefit F55 (With 15 Years of Service)

**11 - Gnrl Dsptch**

2/7/1972	Covered by Act 88
5/1/1946	Fiscal Month - July

**14 - Cty Mgr**

1/1/2006	E2 2.5% COLA for future retirees (10/01/2005)
10/1/2005	Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation)
10/1/2005	Benefit RS 50 (50% Post-Ret. Spouse Benefits)
10/1/2005	8 Year Vesting
10/1/2005	Benefit B-4 (80% max)
10/1/2005	Benefit F55 (With 15 Years of Service)
10/1/2005	Member Contribution Rate 0.00%
10/1/2005	Covered by Act 88
10/1/2005	Day of work defined as 8 Hours a Day for All employees.
5/1/1946	Fiscal Month - July

**15 - City Mgr. aft. 7/1/2012**

7/1/2012	Day of work defined as 8 Hours a Day for All employees.
7/1/2012	Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation)
7/1/2012	Benefit RS 50 (50% Post-Ret. Spouse Benefits)
7/1/2012	8 Year Vesting
7/1/2012	Benefit B-3 (80% max)
7/1/2012	Member Contribution Rate 5.00%
10/1/2005	Covered by Act 88
5/1/1946	Fiscal Month - July

**16 - AFSCME after 7/1/2010**

7/1/2010	Day of work defined as 8 Hours a Day for All employees.
7/1/2010	Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation)
7/1/2010	Benefit B-2
7/1/2010	Benefit F50 (With 25 Years of Service)
7/1/2010	Benefit F55 (With 15 Years of Service)
1/1/2010	10 Year Vesting
1/1/2010	Member Contribution Rate 5.00%
2/7/1972	Covered by Act 88
5/1/1946	Fiscal Month - July

**17 - Non-Union after 1/1/2013**

1/1/2013	Benefit F55 (With 25 Years of Service)
1/1/2013	Member Contribution Rate 5.00%
1/1/2013	Benefit FAC-3 (3 Year Final Average Compensation)
1/1/2013	10 Year Vesting
1/1/2013	Benefit B-2
2/7/1972	Covered by Act 88
5/1/1946	Fiscal Month - July

## Plan Provisions, Actuarial Assumptions, and Actuarial Funding Method

---

Details on MERS plan provisions, actuarial assumptions, and actuarial methodology can be found in the [Appendix](#). Some actuarial assumptions are specific to this municipality and its divisions. These are listed below.

### Increase in Final Average Compensation

Division	FAC Increase Assumption
All Divisions	3.00%

### Withdrawal Rate Scaling Factor

Division	Withdrawal Rate Scaling Factor
All Divisions	100%

### Miscellaneous and Technical Assumptions

Loads – None.

### Amortization Policy for Closed Divisions

Closed Division	Amortization Option
All Closed Divisions	Option A