

**CITY OF YPSILANTI
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
September 2, 2003
MEETING MINUTES**

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Jane Schmiedeke, Chair at 7:03 PM
Meeting Location: City Council Chambers

Commissioners Present: Christian Overland, Hank Prebys, Brenda
Rigdon, Jane Schmiedeke, Robert Taylor

Commissioners Absent: Ron Rupert

Staff Present: Jimar Wilson, Planner

II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

**Motion: Commissioner Overland (Second: Prebys) moved to
approve the agenda, as amended.**

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

III. PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA ITEMS

None.

IV. PUBLIC HEARING

None.

V. BUSINESS SECTION

OLD BUSINESS

215 W Michigan (David's Books and Media), Action Item

Applicant: Glenn Leiding, owner (not present)
Application: Install new awning sign.

Discussion: Staff informed the commission that the applicant was sent a letter stating that his application would be denied at the 9-2-03 meeting if no additional information was received. Since the applicant failed to communicate any additional information, the commission denied the application.

Motion: Commissioner Rigdon (Second: Prebys) moved to deny the application for 215 W Michigan for the installation of an awning sign. The proposed design is inappropriate in the district and there has been no further communication from the applicant.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

410 W Cross (St. John Catholic Church), Action Item

Applicant: Bill Short, contractor (not present)
Application: Install new signage.

Discussion: None.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Overland) moved to table the application for 410 W Cross, pending additional information from the applicant.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

201 N River St (Emmanuel Lutheran Church), Action Item

Applicant: Dale Sucksdorff, Church representative (present)
Application: Install new windows.

Discussion: Mr. Sucksdorff submitted additional information to the commission to supplement the application to install 83 new windows on the 46 year-old addition. In addition to a historical fact sheet on the church, the applicant noted that the proposed windows would greatly reduce the current high energy costs. He stated that, after researching several window companies, it was decided that the proposed window company best met the church's needs. Commissioner Prebys noted that the proposed muntins would be between the panes of glass, and because they did not show the shadow lines, they would be inappropriate.

The commission noted that because the proposed replacement windows are on the addition, that perhaps they could be scrutinized less-heavily. However, they also noted that the two major issues with the proposed windows are the inappropriate muntins and the fact that the HDC has never approved solid vinyl windows. The commission then suggested that the applicants consider exterior muntins on the north and east elevations, and no muntins for the west elevation. The applicant then stated that the church would do additional research and return to the commission at a later date.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Overland) moved to table the application, pending further information from the applicant.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

NEW BUSINESS

310 Florence, Action Item

Applicant: Christina Stringer, owner (present)

Application: Painting.

Discussion: The applicant submitted several paint samples and requested that the commission offer suggestions for paint schemes for the house. She also requested approval to remove a tree in the front yard. The commission offered a couple of suggestions and requested that the applicant make the final decision. The commission further stated that tree should be retained.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Rigdon) moved to approve the application for 310 Florence for the following work: Removal of shutters and painting. The body color shall be Sherwin Williams #6674 Jonquil, trim color shall be SW #6375 Honeycomb and the door shall be painted Hunter Green. The application for the removal of the tree was not approved. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (10) New work shall be removable.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

323 Maple St, Action Item

Applicant: Chloe Duke, owner (present)

Application: Repair carriage house; painting.

Discussion: The applicants want to undo inappropriate work previously done to the front porch fascia and return it to its original character. The commission informed the applicants that the proposed railing on the front porch would require an interior graspable handrail and should be painted. The applicants also want to repair the bottom 2' of rotted wood on the carriage house. The applicants then propose to paint the house, carriage house and the fence in the submitted color samples.

Motion: Commissioner Rigdon (Second: Prebys) moved to approve the applications for 323 Maple St for the following work: Restoring the porch fascia and installing handrails at the porch steps. Railings shall match the current railing system and have an interior graspable handrail. The proposed handrail down the stairs shall meet the porch columns where the existing railing around the porch meets the porch columns. The application is also approved for painting. The body color shall be Benjamin Moore #OC-7 Creamy White, the trim color shall be BM #HC-115 Georgian Green, and the accent color shall be #2092-20 Siena. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (10) New work shall be removable.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

Motion: Commissioner Rigdon (Second: Prebys) moved to approve the applications for 323 Maple St for the following work: Repair the lower 2' of rotted wood on the perimeter of the carriage house by inserting horizontal boards beneath the battens in a continuous band; install a rat wall on the inside perimeter of the carriage house; paint the carriage house in the same colors approved in Decision Sheet 323 Maple 9-2-03 A. The fence shall be painted and primed or stained opaque to match the body color of the house. The following Secretary of the Interior

**Standards were used in making this decision: (10)
New work shall be removable.**

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

207 N Hamilton, Action Item

Applicant: Robert Ratcliff (Roberts Chimney and Masonry), not present)
Application: Masonry repair.

Discussion: From photos taken earlier in the day (9-2-03), it appeared to the commission the re-pointing had already been performed and that the mortar appeared to be primarily of Portland cement and thus inappropriate for a soft-brick chimney.

Motion: Commissioner Overland (Second: Rigdon) moved to deny to the application for 207 N Hamilton for the following work: Masonry repair. The mortar is inappropriate. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (2) Do not destroy original character. Do not remove or alter historic material or features and (5) Preserve distinctive features.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

404 N Huron, Action Item

Applicant: Bill French, owner (not present)
Application: Painting.

Discussion: The commission decided to take action on the application, as submitted.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Rigdon) moved to approve the application for 404 N Huron for the following work: Painting. The body color shall be Benjamin Moore #HC-52 Ansonia Peach and the trim color shall be white. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (10) New work shall be removable.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

208 E Cross, Action Item

Applicant: Tarek Kanaan, owner (present)

Application: Window replacement.

Discussion: The applicant proposes to install 17 new wood Weather Guard sash replacements with 7/8" external muntins. He plans to replace all windows for the house with the exception being the one window in the kitchen window and the 2nd story bathroom window. All original exterior window trim will remain in place. Commissioner Rigdon, having visited the property, reported that the existing original windows were beyond repair.

Motion: Commissioner Overland (Second: Rigdon) moved to approve the application for 208 E Cross for the following work: Replacement of seventeen window openings with sash replacement kits from Weathershield. The windows shall be double-hung, six over six and painted white to match the exterior. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (10) new work shall be removable.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

316 Pearl, Action Item

Applicant: Itohan Osayimwese and David Sisson, owners (not present)

Application: Install new fence.

Discussion: The commission decided to take action on the application, as submitted.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Overland) moved to approve the application for 316 Pearl for the following work: Your application was approved for the following work: Installation of fencing, as submitted in Figure 2, Figure 3 and Figure 4 of the submitted plans. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (10) new work shall be removable.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

2-4 Water Street, 2-116 E Michigan, Action Item

Applicant: Brett Lenart, City of Ypsilanti (present)

Application: Demolition of 9 structures.

Discussion: Mr. Lenart appeared before the commission representing the City's interests in demolishing several properties in order to proceed with the Water St Redevelopment Project. Since it was obvious that most of the buildings along East Michigan Avenue have some levels of historic significance, the commission moved to schedule a public hearing.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Rigdon) moved to table the application, pending public hearing.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

210 W Michigan, Action Item

Applicant: Brenda Rigdon, contractor (present)

Application: Amend previous approval.

Discussion: Ms. Rigdon requested an amendment to the previously approved application for 210 W Michigan to include work to be performed on the pilasters.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Overland) moved to amend the previously approved application for 210 W Michigan to include the following work: Encasing both pilasters with MDO sign board material. Trim work shall blend parts of the pilasters that belong to this building into the storefront. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (5) Preserve distinctive features and (10) New work shall be removable.

**Approval: 4 to 0. Commissioner Rigdon abstained.
Action carried.**

STUDY ITEMS

416 N Huron, Study Item

Applicant: Steven Wild, owner (present)

Application: Rebuild carriage house.

Discussion: The owner appeared before the commission to discuss his plans for rebuilding the carriage house. Mr. Wild stated that he is having difficulty financing the reconstruction of the carriage house and that, because of zoning issues, he may

not be able to rebuild the carriage house for residential use. Staff will coordinate a meeting with representatives from the Planning and Development Department, planning commission, historic district commission and other interested parties to come to a mutually acceptable agreement on how to proceed with reconstruction.

119 W Michigan, Study Item

Applicant: Joe Morawski, contractor (present)

Application: Masonry repair.

Discussion: The applicant appeared before the commission to ensure that he and the commission are both clear on the type of brick that shall be used for the previously approved masonry repair. The agreed upon material, for the record, is Jumbo Rosewood *Clear A* by Belden Brick Company.

OTHER BUSINESS

PROPERTY MONITORING

601 N River St

Ken Posner, attorney for Wallside Windows appeared before the commission in an attempt to have the citation issued to Wallside for violating the Historic Preservation Ordinance dropped. He argued that the Wallside associate who contracted the work was operating from a list of Ypsilanti historic district addresses that did not include the subject property at 601 N River. He also argued that the state Building Code does not require an owner to obtain a building permit for window replacement where there are no changes to the opening or egress/ingress requirements. The commission noted to Mr. Posner that this is not the first time an issue like this has come before them. They also stated that not only does Wallside have an accurate list of historic district addresses, but also that Wallside was instructed to call to and verify whether or not a property was in the district. The commission requested that either the windows be restored or that the citation for violating the Ordinance be issued. Mr. Posner stated that he would return to Wallside and submit plans for replacing the most prominent windows on the building with wood windows from another manufacturer, as opposed to all 19 windows. Mr. Posner will have these plans at the next HDC meeting and staff will inform the city attorney of these proceedings in light of the pending case in district court.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

None.

VI. HOUSEKEEPING BUSINESS

Approval of the minutes from the August 5, 2003 meeting.

Page 6, The proposed sign is backlit and backlit signs are not inappropriate in the district...*has been changed to...***The proposed sign is backlit and backlit signs are inappropriate in the district.**

Page 8, **Window replacements for...**has been removed from the first sentence of the motion for 23-25 E Cross.

Page 8, **along with the window replacement...**has been removed from the sixth sentence of the motion for 23-25 E Cross.

Page 8, The 4th floor window replacements shall be half-round topped windows to match existing windows...*has been changed to...***The 4th floor window replacements shall be sash and frame replacements, and the other floors shall be sash only replacements.**

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Taylor) moved to approve the minutes, as submitted.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

Approval of the minutes from the August 19, 2003 meeting.

Page 1, The roll was corrected to note Commissioner Overland's absence.

Page 4, to paint the back porch and skirt to math the front porch...*has been changed to...***to paint the back porch and skirt to match the front porch.**

Page 4, The skirting shall be made of pre-made cedar slab arranged in a 4 x 4 square grid...*has been changed...***The skirting shall be made of pre-made cedar lattice arranged in a 4 x 4 square grid.**

Page 8, While such work generally does require HDC approval, the commission is finds it appropriate to note for record all exterior work performed in the historic district...*has been changed to...***While such work generally does not require HDC approval, to commission finds it appropriate to note for the record all exterior work performed in the historic district.**

Page 9, The proposed signage (two signs) will be model the sign in front of 119 N Huron...*has been changed to...***The proposed signage (two signs) will model the sign in front of 119 N Huron.**

Page 9, The approval to the motion for 125 N Huron was changed from unanimous to 5 to 0, with Commissioner Rigdon abstaining.

Page 9, The windows are original with tiny muntins that, according to the commission, cannot be replaced...*has been changed to...***The windows are original with tiny muntins that, according to the commission, cannot be duplicated.**

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Overland) moved to approve the minutes, as submitted.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Rigdon) moved to adjourn the meeting.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 10:10 PM.

Signature _____

Date_____