

**CITY OF YPSILANTI
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
September 16, 2003
MEETING MINUTES**

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Jane Schmiedeke, Chair at 7:03 PM
Meeting Location: City Council Chambers

Commissioners Present: Christian Overland, Hank Prebys, Brenda Rigdon, Ron Rupert, Jane Schmiedeke

Commissioners Absent: Robert Taylor

Staff Present: Jimar Wilson, Planner

II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Motion: Commissioner Rupert (Second: Prebys) moved to approve the agenda.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

III. PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA ITEMS

None.

IV. PUBLIC HEARING

Proposed demolition of the structures at **2-4 Water St, 2 E Michigan, 6-8 E Michigan, 10 E Michigan, 14 E Michigan, 34-38 E Michigan, 40 E Michigan, 102-116 E Michigan.**

Applicant: Brett Lenart, City of Ypsilanti (present)

Application: A request to demolish 9 structures

Motion: Commissioner Rupert (Second: Prebys) moved to open the public hearing.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

Discussion: Mr. Lenart appeared before the commission representing the City's interest in demolishing several properties in order to proceed with the Water St Redevelopment Project. He provided information to the commission on the status of each property and outlined the Historic District ordinance condition(s) under which the City was applying in order to qualify for demolition approval. The commission noted for the record that 34-38 E Michigan had been authorized for demolition previously, but the required building permit had not been filed or had expired. Since there was no public comment from the audience, the commission proceeded to determine whether or not the structures met any of the conditions for demolition.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Rupert) moved to close the public hearing.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Overland) moved to take action on the application.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

Motion: Commissioner Rigdon (Second: Prebys) moved to approve the application for the demolition of 2-4 Water St and 2 E Michigan, 6-8 E Michigan, 10E Michigan, 14 E Michigan, 34-38 E Michigan, 40 E Michigan and 102-116 E Michigan based on the fact that one or more of the following conditions prevail to issue a notice to proceed for each structure:

2-4 Water St

Sec. 54-83(c)(1) the resource constitutes a hazard to the safety of the public or the occupants, and Sec. 54-83(c)(2) the resource is a deterrent to a major improvement program that will be of substantial benefit to the community.

2 E Michigan

54-83(c)(2)

6-8 E Michigan

54-83(c)(2) and 54-83(c)(4) Retaining the resource is not in the interest of the majority of the community.

10 E Michigan

54-83(c)(2)

14 E Michigan

54-83(c)(2), 54-83(c)(4)

34-38 E Michigan

54-83(c)(2)

40 E Michigan

54-83(c)(2)

102-116 E Michigan

54-83(c)(2), 54-83(c)(4)

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

V. BUSINESS SECTION

OLD BUSINESS

410 W Cross (St. John Catholic Church), Action Item

Applicant: Bill Short, contractor (present)

Application: Install new signage.

Discussion: The applicant revised plans that the commission found appropriate to both the building and historic district.

Motion: Commissioner Rigdon (Second: Overland) moved to approve the application for 410 W Cross for the installation of a ground sign as submitted in the 9-16-03 plans. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (10) New work shall be removable.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

201 N River St (Emmanuel Lutheran Church), Action Item

Applicant: Dale Sucksdorff, Church representative (present)

Application: Install new windows.

Discussion: Mr. Sucksdorff brought before the board a sample of the proposed window. The window sample did in fact fit the criteria set forth by the commission at the last meeting. In particular, the muntin details were found appropriate to the building and the historic district.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Rupert) moved to approve the application for 201 N River for the following work: Replacement of windows. The windows shall be vinyl by Sunrise with fixed muntin bars on the exterior. Internal muntins are also required. The window color shall be tan, as shown on the submitted sample. These new windows are replacing inappropriate aluminum windows and the vinyl is seen as a major improvement to the aluminum. Because the original windows are made of aluminum, the vinyl replacements are seen as appropriate because they employ another, hard-edged, modern material. This in no way should be seen as setting a precedent for the use of vinyl windows in other buildings of the Historic District. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (5) Preserve distinctive features.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

207 N Hamilton, Action Item

Applicant: Robert Ratcliff, Roberts Chimney and Masonry, (present)

Application: Masonry repair.

Discussion: The applicant re-submitted an application for masonry work that had been denied at the 9-2-03 meeting. From photos taken on 9-2-03, it appeared to the commission the re-pointing had already been done and that the mortar appeared to be primarily of Portland cement and thus inappropriate for a soft-brick chimney. However, the applicant explained that the present appearance of the chimney is the result of earlier work poorly done, that no new work has yet been performed and that an appropriate mortar will be used for the currently proposed re-pointing.

Motion: Commissioner Rigdon (Second: Overland) moved to approve to the application for 207 N Hamilton for the following work: Re-pointing, following the HDC Mortar Fact Sheet and using a soft mortar. The mortar shall match the original in color and tooling. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (10) New work shall be removable.

Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.

NEW BUSINESS

61 N Huron, Action Item

Applicant: Mike Condon, Ypsilanti Restoration (present)

Application: Masonry repair, window replacement.

Discussion: The applicant wishes to perform masonry work on the north elevation of the building, according to the submitted work plans dated 9-16-02. The proposed replacement windows will be pebble grey by Marvin Windows.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Rupert) moved to approve the application for 61 N Huron for the following work: Masonry and window repair as indicated in the submitted proposal dated 9-16-03. All work shall be performed on the north elevation. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (5) Preserve distinctive features, (7) Clean building gently, no sandblasting and (10) New work shall be removable.

Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.

15 S Adams, Action Item

Applicant: David Herman, owner (present)

Application: Painting.

Discussion: The applicant proposes to wash and paint the building. He submitted paint samples and shingle colors that the commission found appropriate. The commission informed the applicant that power washing is not allowed and that the building can only be cleaned using a low-pressure hose with mild detergent.

Motion: Commissioner Overland (Second: Rupert) moved to approve the application for 15 S Adams for the following work: Paint by Olympic - Body shall be Butter 111-3, Trim shall be Silver Feathers 530-1 and Sash shall be Green Ripple 306-6. The brick shall be cleaned only with a mild detergent and water hose. An oil based primer shall be used. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (7) Clean building gently, no sandblasting and (10) New work shall be removable.

Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.

18 W Michigan, Action Item

Applicant: Michael Kabat, owner (present)

Application: Masonry repair.

Discussion: The applicant proposes to re-point the chimney and replace any damaged brick. All new mortar shall match the original in color and tooling.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Rigdon) moved to approve the application for 18 W Michigan for the following work: Re-pointing of the chimney. The new mortar shall match the existing mortar in texture, color and tooling, as per the HDC Mortar Fact Sheet. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (5) Preserve distinctive features and (10) New work shall be removable.

Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.

203 N Washington, Action Item

Applicant: Daniel Worley, owner (present)

Application: Gutter replacement.

Discussion: The applicant proposes to install 6" half-round gutters and 4" round corrugated downspouts. The gutters will be mounted in roof-mount hangers attached to the roof beneath the shingles.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Rupert) moved to approve the application for the following work at 203 N Washington for the: Installation of hangers under the roof shingles and the installation of 6" half-round gutters. The drip edges shall be white and the downspouts shall be in line with the corner boards. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (10) new work shall be removable.

Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.

52 E Cross, Action Item

Applicant: Christine King, owner (present)

Application: Paint exterior of building.

Discussion: The applicant proposes to paint the exterior of the building and submitted paint samples and drawings that the commission found appropriate.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Rupert) moved to approve the application for 52 E Cross for the following work: Painting of the front and back of the exterior of the building with a satin finish latex coat. The walls shall be painted Sherman Williams Gauseling, accent 1 shall be painted SW purple/lilac, accent 2 shall be Benjamin Moore #HC-142 Stratton Blue and the doors shall be painted SW #6139 Mossy Gold. No power washing is allowed. Only mild detergents and low-pressure water hoses shall be used. An oil-based primer shall be used as well. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (10) new work shall be removable.

Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.

25 N Washington, Action Item

Applicant: Dave Curtis, owner of 23 N Washington (present)

Application: Construct rear deck and staircase.

Discussion: The applicant proposes to construct a rear staircase to serve as an exit from the second floor of 25 N Washington. The structure will also serve as an emergency exit to the second

floor on 17 N Washington. This structure will be entirely within the vacant area between 17 and 25 N Washington. An exit gate will serve (at ground level) to limit entry to the area to only those people (owners and tenants) with a key.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Rupert) moved to approve the application for 25 N Washington to include the following work: Installation of a staircase at the rear of 25 N Washington per submitted plans dated 7-24-03. The application is also approved for revisions to the balustrades. All construction shall follow the HDC Porch Fact Sheet. The structure shall be painted. The wrought-iron gate be painted a dark brown color and shall have a panic bar to be painted black, shall be non-ornamental. Spear points may be used. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (10) New work shall be removable.

Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.

117 E Forest, Action Item

Applicant: Robert Rousseau, owner (present)

Application: Construct rear addition.

Discussion: The applicant proposes to construct a rear addition, as per the submitted plans. He also proposes to install a rat wall around the perimeter of the kitchen, and to install vinyl siding. The commission informed the applicant that vinyl siding is inappropriate.

Motion: Commissioner Rigdon (Second: Rupert) moved to approve the application for 117 E Forest for the following work: Installation of an addition in the rear, as shown on submitted drawings dated 9-16-03. Several changes have been made to the plans and have been noted; installation of a bay window in place of double-hung window currently there; installation of a new wood door; six light over 2 panels, in the rear to match the door in the front of the house. The new siding shall match existing aluminum siding. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (10) New work shall be removable.

Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.

601 N River St, Action Item

Applicant: Ken Posner, Attorney for Wallside Windows (present), Mark McManus, Supervisor of installation for Wallside Windows (present), Mrs. Ida Meadows, owner (present)

Application: Install new windows.

Discussion: Mr. Posner requested reconsideration of the earlier denial of an application for the solid vinyl windows installed without approval at 601 N River. Mr. Posner also submitted an alternative plan for the replacement of the seven most prominent windows with wood windows that may be vinyl clad, as previously agreed upon at the 9-2-03 HDC meeting between Mr. Posner and the commission. Mr. Posner's reconsideration request was based on his arguments that the property is not a contributing structure of the local historic district, that the proposed wood windows would not give the owner the same 35-year warranty that the current windows carry and that wood windows would be burdensome on the owners in terms of maintenance. The commission informed Mr. Posner that the property is in fact a contributing structure to the local historic district per City Ordinance and State designation. As for maintenance by the owners, the commission would allow vinyl clad wood windows which would not present any difficulties to the owners. Mr. McManus of Wallside Windows proposed the installation of full replacement vinyl egress windows which would bring the size of the sash and glass to its original configuration. The commission found those windows to be unsatisfactory because of the solid vinyl material and because egress windows are not appropriate to the building. Following further discussion, the commission recommended that the applicants proceed with their proposal to install 7 new vinyl clad wood windows in the most prominent sections of the building, as agreed upon previously.

Motion: Commissioner Rupert (Second: Prebys) moved to approve the application for 601 N River for the following work: Removal of the seven solid vinyl Wallside windows in the main part of building and installation of seven vinyl-clad wood windows in the rough openings. Windows shall be "low-E" glass. The

particular windows to be replaced are the 4 on the easternmost side of the south elevation, the 2 on the east elevation and 1 on the north elevation. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (10) New work shall be removable.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

418 Oak, Action Item

Applicant: Christian Dodd, owner (present)

Application: Re-roofing and painting.

Discussion: The applicant proposes to paint the siding of the house and replace the roof shingles with black (charcoal) architectural shingles.

Motion: Commissioner Rupert (Second: Prebys) moved to approve the application for 418 Oak for the following work: Replacement of roof shingles with black (charcoal) architectural shingles. The drip edge shall be black. The application is also approved for painting. The body color shall be Benjamin Moore (BM) #HC-99 Abingdon putty, the trim color shall be BM# HC-122 Great Barrington Green and the accent color shall be BM #HC-50 Georgian Brick. All wood areas shall be primed with an oil-based primer and the final latex paint shall have a satin finish. The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: (10) New work shall be removable.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

STUDY ITEMS

61 N Huron, Study Item

Applicant: Mike Condon, Ypsilanti Restoration (present)

Application: Window replacement.

Discussion: The applicant wanted to discuss window replacement for 6 windows on the second story of the front of the building with a window that is different in style and configuration from the original windows. His plans presented two options

for replacement. The first option called for the installation of 6 new Marvin double hung 2 over 2 tilt-wash windows with insulating glazing. The window head jamb will be constructed of 5/4" white pine to fill the masonry radius. The second option called for windows with a true radius head jamb and upper sash. The commission gave the applicant suggestions on a more appropriate configuration in relation to cost constraints to the owner.

206 S Washington, Study Item

Applicant: James Fink, owner (present)

Application: Install iron fencing.

Discussion: The applicant wanted to discuss the possibility of installing a wrought iron fence around the perimeter of the house where no fencing currently exists. After discussing his plans and receiving conceptual feedback from the commission, he will proceed with submitting the required HDC Work Permit application.

OTHER BUSINESS

PROPERTY MONITORING

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

None.

VI. HOUSEKEEPING BUSINESS

Approval of the minutes from the September 2, 2003 meeting.

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Overland) moved to approve the minutes, as submitted.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Motion: Commissioner Prebys (Second: Overland) moved to adjourn the meeting.

**Approval: Unanimous.
Action carried.**

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 10:21 PM.

Signature _____

Date_____