

CITY OF YPSILANTI
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES of NOVEMBER 7, 2006

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Jane Schmiedeke Chair 7:00 PM

Meeting Location: City Hall Meeting Room

Commissioners Present: Jane Schmiedeke, Hank Prebys, Ron Rupert, Brenda Rigdon, Joe Schultz, Ed Penet

Commissioners Absent: Christian Overland

Staff Present: Richard Murphy, Planner I
 Cristin Moody, HDC Intern

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Motion: Prebys (Second: Penet) moves to approve the agenda as presented.

Approval: Unanimous. Action carried.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA ITEMS - None

PUBLIC HEARING - None

OLD BUSINESS –

309 Washtenaw, Action Item

Applicant: Steve Rand, owner (Present)

Discussion: The application is to remove a balcony porch from the rear of the house that has become deteriorated and dangerous. Commissioner Schmiedeke asks applicant what will become of the door access to the balcony after removal of the balcony. Applicant responds that the door will be removed and the opening will be converted to a window with a double hung vinyl window installed in the opening. The remaining area of the doorway will be enclosed and wood sided on the exterior to match the rest of house. Commissioner Prebys indicates that a vinyl window will not be acceptable, only wood or wood clad with vinyl or aluminum, and also that the other

windows on the house are one over one, so the new window should not have muntins or inserted dividers. Commissioner Rigdon asks if new materials will be painted to match and explains that only the same materials as existing should be used for the new siding. Commissioner Rupert suggests priming the back (interior) side of the clapboards to help preserve them.

Motion: Rigdon (Second: Penet) moves to approve the application for work at 309 Washtenaw to include the removal of a second story porch deck, which was added after initial construction of the house and is now unsafe. The existing door shall be removed and replaced with a double hung, one-over-one, wood window (clad in vinyl or aluminum acceptable) and any exposed areas shall be covered with beveled cedar siding to match existing and be installed smooth side out, primed on both sides and painted to match existing house color. The roof over the porch shall also be removed, requiring the installation of new gutters, which will be k-style gutters to match existing.

The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision:
#10 – New work shall be removable.

Approval: Unanimous. Action carried.

501 N. River, Action Item

Applicant: Robert Hamilton, owner (Not Present)

Discussion: The application is for replacement of all windows on the house.

Motion: Prebys (Second: Penet) moves to deny the application for work at 501 N. River due to lack of the receipt of requested information within 60 days.

Approval: Unanimous. Action carried.

310 N. Park, Action Item

Applicant: Mike Marino, owner (Present)

Discussion: The applicant has submitted a grading plan and section of a proposed garage as supplement to a previously approved application for construction of a new garage and alterations to the house. Commissioners felt that the previous application lacked enough information regarding the landscaping and grading changes in the back yard where the new garage is to be built. Commissioners ask about plans for construction of retaining walls and drainage. Applicant indicates that the walls will be constructed using natural local fieldstone and will have a tiled drain. Commissioners discuss the appropriateness in the historic district of the proposed landscape changes.

Motion: Rigdon (Second: Prebys) moves to amend the previously approved application for work at 310 N. Park to include the grading plan with appropriate retaining walls and drainage to be provided to prevent runoff onto adjacent properties. The following drawings are appended to the previous application: 310 N.

Park topographic site plan dated October 24, 2006 showing existing and new contours and long section of garage dated November, 2006.

Approval: Unanimous. Action carried.

107 E. Cross, Action Item

Applicant: David Kircher, owner (Present)

Discussion: Application is for replacement of missing sections of existing aluminum siding. Due to a court order, the Commission must act on this application during this meeting. Applicant has indicated on materials submitted to the Building Department that 9 windows and 3 exterior doors will be replaced at various locations around the building, but no application has been made to the Commission for that work. The Building Department and City Attorney have also identified further work that is required for nuisance abatement at this property, indicated in a letter dated April 11, 2006, from Karl Barr to the applicant. An HDC application must be provided for review before exterior work may be approved or performed.

The applicant notes that replacement aluminum siding used in the work applied for will match the existing: siding will be off-white with smooth finish. Applicant questions the need for some of the work listed in the April 11 letter, stating that he has asked the Building Department for a list of code violations to be addressed, and has not received this. Applicant states that some windows only need glass replaced; those windows that need sash replacement will be custom rebuilt to match existing.

Commissioner Schultz states that the proposal before the Commission is only for aluminum siding work; the Commission can consider applications for other work at such time that those applications are provided, but at this time only has the option of approving or denying the siding work. Commissioner Rigdon notes that the Commission does have precedent for approving applications for only some work on buildings that require significant additional work, including applications where the work proposed is merely to stabilize the structure, and not to fully rehabilitate it. Commissioner Prebys questions whether the property shouldn't be repaired with appropriate materials in the case where major damage has been done, rather than repair with inappropriate materials, such as the aluminum proposed. Commissioner Schmiedeke notes that the Commission usually encourages repair with matching materials, unless existing material is to all be removed in the process. Commissioner Penet states that this house is in desperate need of major work; tacking on siding without addressing the condition of the underlying material or the remainder of work needed to the property would be inappropriate. Staff confirmed that the Building Department does still consider the entire list of work referenced in the April 11 letter to be necessary, and is still pursuing full rehabilitation of the property. Commissioner Schultz states that he personally disagrees with the applicant, and believes that everything in the April 11 letter is probably necessary and does fall into the HDC's purview, but that arguing those questions at this meeting would be unproductive, and can be decided later. At this meeting, the Commission may consider the siding work proposed, as a stopgap measure to protect the property against further damage, even though it does not constitute full rehabilitation.

Motion: Schultz (Second: Prebys) moves to approve application for work at 107 E. Cross. The scope of work is limited to only the repair of portions of the aluminum siding on the rear portion of that building. The new siding used in repair shall exactly match the existing aluminum siding in color and size, and shall be aligned with existing siding.

The area on which siding shall be repaired includes only the rear, single-story portion of the building, inclusive of approximately 400 square feet on the west side of the main portion of the building, and approximately 400 square feet on the rear portion of the east side of the main portion of the building. Complete removal and replacement of siding is not approved.

Should any future work to this property require the further removal of siding, the applicant must make application and return to the HDC for additional approvals before performing that work.

The applicant has indicated on documents submitted to the Building Department that 9 windows and 3 exterior doors are to be replaced at various locations on this building. That work is denied as the applicant has not provided the Historic District Commission with sufficient information on the proposed work to approve it.

While significant further work on the exterior of the building has been identified as necessary including work on roof, chimney, porch, etc., the applicant has not made any application to the HDC for this work. The HDC therefore cannot and does not approve any such work at this time.

This approval is subject to proper installation of materials as approved by the building department.

Approval: Motion carries, with Commissioner Penet voting against.

NEW BUSINESS

119 N. Hamilton, Action Item

Applicant: Chris Zellner and Kevin Igielski, owners (Present)

Discussion: Application is for the installation of a single replacement window. Commissioners review photographs showing multiple vinyl replacement windows already installed, as well as a set of vinyl French doors installed on the second story rear (west) side of house, all without building permits or HDC review. Applicants indicate that they have recently purchased the property and were not familiar with the permit and HDC approval requirements. Commissioners inform applicants that vinyl windows are not acceptable for replacing historic windows and new windows should match the configuration of existing windows.

Motion: Ridgon (Second: Prebys) moves to deny the application for work at 119 N. Hamilton including the installation of a new vinyl window due to inappropriateness.

Approval: Unanimous. Action carried.

105 W. Michigan Ave., Action Item

Applicant: Roger Cunningham, contractor (Not Present)

Discussion: The application is for installation of vinyl lettering on the store windows.

Motion: Rigdon (Second: Prebys) moves to approve the sign application for 105 W. Michigan Ave. as proposed.

Approval: Unanimous. Action carried.

400 N. River, Action Item

Applicant: Stewart Beal, contractor (Present)

Discussion: The application is for foundation and structural repairs. Applicant presents copies of architectural drawings detailing the proposed work.

Motion: Rigdon (Second: Prebys) moves to approve the application for work at 400 N. River to include structural reinforcement of the west façade and reinforcement of existing foundation as well as the creation of new window openings in the south elevation as shown in the drawings submitted by JC Beal on October 3, 2006.

The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: #6 – Repair, do not replace and #10 – New work shall be removable.

Approval: Unanimous. Action carried.

319 S. Washington, Action Item

Applicant: Myree Ervin, Ypsilanti Association of Women's Clubs (Present)

Discussion: The application is for exterior repainting of house. Applicant submits color samples and photographs showing the proposed placement of each color on the house body and trim.

Motion: Prebys (Second: Penet) moves to approve the application for work at 319 S. Washington to include exterior painting using oil based primer and latex satin finish final coat. Colors to be Sherwin Williams (SW) 6179 (Artichoke) for the body, SW 6181 (Secret Garden) for the trim, and SW 6025 (Socialite), SW 6027 (Cordova) and SW 6021 (Dreamy White) as accent colors.

The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: #10 – New work shall be removable.

Approval: Unanimous. Action carried.

220 N. Huron, Action Item

Applicant: Al Rudisil and Jerry Jennings, Ypsilanti Historical Society (Present)
Don MacMullan, architect (Present)

Discussion: The application is for the construction of an ADA compliant basement entrance and a replacement cellar door, both on the north side of the building, and the installation of a new storm door at the south entrance. Applicant submits architectural drawings showing the new construction plans which include a wheelchair lift and stairwell. Commissioners discuss appropriate types of doors and windows for this new entrance.

Motion: Rigdon (Second: Rupert) moves to approve the application for work at 220 N. Huron to include a small addition housing a wheelchair lift and stairwell to provide access to the basement level. The materials and design shall be as shown in the drawings submitted on November 1, 2006 with the following exceptions: the windows in the enclosure shall not have muntins and the door shall have a single upper half light and two vertical panels below. The paint colors are to be white for the body and trim, the roofing material shall be black. The proposed storm door and cellar door for installation are also approved. The cellar door shall be painted brown. Additionally, the installation of a concrete sidewalk leading from the front walkway to the new entrance is approved and may include north/south walks to the adjacent parking areas.

The following Secretary of the Interior Standards were used in making this decision: #9 – Contemporary designs shall be compatible and shall not destroy significant original material.

Approval: Unanimous. Action carried.

STUDY ITEMS

100 E. Cross, Study Item

Applicant: Jack Miller and Becky Lewis, Ypsilanti Auto Heritage Museum (Present)

Discussion: The applicants explain that their lease with the railroad company for a strip of land bordering the tracks and running from North River to North Park requires them to construct a fence along the railroad tracks, separating the Auto Museum parking lot from the tracks. They are considering a black vinyl coated chain link fence for the entire span. Commissioners indicate that chain link fence would not be appropriate and offer suggestions for a variety of other options which would be acceptable. Commissioners also express openness to the possibility of two different types of fencing – a more decorative type along the ends that face River and Park Streets and a plainer type in the interior of the property.

402 S. Huron, Study Item

Applicant: Abdul Nimer, prospective buyer (Present)

Discussion: Applicant submits photographs of the current condition of the house as well as photographs of other houses in the historic district that he likes. He also shows samples of materials he would like to use in rehabilitating the house, including a wood window, roof shingles and fiber cement siding to replace the aluminum siding. Applicant is informed that if the fiber cement siding is applied, the smooth side must face out instead of the faux wood grain textured side. Commissioners instruct the applicant on the Secretary of the Interior Standards and general rules regarding acceptable materials and when to repair or replace existing materials.

309 N. Hamilton, Study Items

Applicant: Derrick Padgett, owner (Present)

Discussion: Applicant indicates that he is considering replacing the front door and the door jamb and asks about the possibility of replacing with a metal door. Commissioners inform the applicant that a metal door will not be acceptable, but the door could possibly be replaced with a new wood door if he brings information demonstrating that the existing door is not original to the house. Commissioners request photographs of the door and trim at a future meeting.

OTHER BUSINESS

Administrative Approvals

121 W. Michigan Ave.	Re-roofing
115 W. Michigan Ave.	Re-roofing
114 Woodward	Re-roofing
22 N. Huron	Re-roofing
410 N. Huron	Re-roofing

Motion: Prebys (Second: Rigdon) moves to approve the administrative approvals.

Approval: Unanimous. Action carried.

Property Monitoring

402 S. Huron – Before HDC today; no work done since last update.

310 N. Park – Before HDC today; no work done to grounds since last update.

110 N. River – Approved masonry work is underway since last meeting, at base of building. No application yet for fence.

218 Ferris – Ticket issued for inappropriate steps; no response yet.

102 N. Hamilton – Second letter sent regarding sign; deadline to correct placement before next meeting.

307 N. Hamilton – Second deadline missed; no response. Will be issuing ticket.

410 N. Hamilton – No response. Will send second letter.

208 E. Cross – Staff spoke with owner. Owner is aware of Commission's concern with exposed Tyvek, and will evaluate condition of Tyvek before siding and replace as necessary.

110 W. Cross – Firehouse Museum has completed masonry repairs on the northwest corner of the building without permits or approval and the bricks and mortar do not match.

218 N. River – Construction dumpster in front yard; work underway unknown. This address received letter in January 2005 regarding unspecified unauthorized exterior work; no follow-up recorded or indication in file or minutes what that work was.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS – None

HOUSEKEEPING BUSINESS

Approval of the minutes from the October 17, 2006 meeting

Motion: Penet (Second: Rigdon) moves to approve the minutes of October 17, 2006 as presented.

Approval: Unanimous. Motion carries

ADJOURNMENT

Motion: Prebys (Second: Rigdon) moves to adjourn the meeting.

Approval: Unanimous. Motion Carries.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 9:30 PM