



**CITY OF YPSILANTI
BLUE RIBBON FINANCE COMMITTEE
MEETING MINUTES
WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 19, 2005
6:00 P.M.**

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 6:10 p.m., by Chairperson Paul Tait.

II. ROLL CALL

Present: Paul Tait, James Hawkins, Timothy Robinson, Peter Fletcher, Ingrid Kock, Frederick Davis,

Absent: Deborah Strong (arrived at 6:25), Steve Pierce (arrived at 6:35), Christian Overland, Thomas Biggs (arrived at 6:30)

Motion to excuse those absent given by Peter Fletcher and supported by James Hawkins. Motion carried.

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of Meetings Minutes of January 12, 2005. Motion to approve minutes with corrections.

IV. PRESENTATIONS / DISCUSSION

Paul Tait opened the meeting to discuss the questions outlined at the last BRFC meeting and the reference checks provided by the Finance Director, Marilou Uy.

Ed Koryzno said after reviewing the information, there were three items that attracted his attention. 1) The cities of Ann Arbor, East Lansing and Mt. Clemens, because of the amount of tax exempt properties, fall more in line with Ypsilanti than the other cities cited. 2) The Plante Moran (PM) staff has all been PM staff when they conducted the studies. 3) PM look-up tables may be able to be put on the web page, or distributed hard copy for those who may not have computer access. He said these three items swayed him to favor PM over the lower proposal offered by Rehmann Robson (RR).

Paul Tait brought up the amount of staff time involved. RR said they were looking at eight to ten staff people as opposed to a few finance people with relatively limited hours. The difference in costs could be absorbed quickly in man-hours.

The Committee discussed the finding of the responses by Plante Moran and Rehmann Robson. They compared the projected amount of staff time used by each company. The difference in approach to answering the questions by each bidder, Plante Moran talking more to numbers and Rehmann Robson with more discussion. The specifics of who would be responsible from each bidder during the study and whether they had direct involvement for their respective companies in the studies referenced.

Fred Davis commented on the models suggested by both bidders and supported Ed Koryzno's comments. James Hawkins talked about the difference in bids being only \$4,000 - \$5,000 which could easily be absorbed by staff time, and his support of a firm our staff would be most comfortable working with, especially with PM experience, background and prior work.

Ingrid Kock suggested a follow-up question to Rehmann Robson with regard to the number of hours required by City staff.

Deborah Strong asked how much Rehmann Robb proposed. RR asked for \$17,460 plus \$300 for travel. PM asked for \$20,000 plus \$2,500 for data.

Peter Fletcher recommended that the BRFC recommend to City Council that Plante Moran do the Income Tax Analysis Study for the City of Ypsilanti. James Hawkins supported the recommendation.

Ingrid Kock said she was not convinced there would be a difference in the quality that would merit going with the more expensive proposal. Deborah Strong said she felt the involvement PM had with the Ann Arbor and East Lansing studies would give them more familiarity with Ypsilanti and our needs. James Hawkins suggested further discussion in the desire to achieve unanimity

A vote was put to the Committee.

Aye: 7 Nays: 1 (Kock) Absent: 2 (Overland/Pierce) Vote:

Presentation to City Council will take place at the February 1, 2005, 7:30 p.m. meeting and Paul Tait said he would explain our rationale for the recommendation, particularly because we did not go with the lower bid and will provide notes to Council before the meeting.

V. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

None

VI. INFORMATION / REQUESTS BY THE COMMITTEE

- A. Plante Moran response to questions raised by the Committee
- B. Rehmann Robson response to questions raised by the Committee

VII. LIAISON REPORT

VIII. DISCUSSION / ACTIONS BY THE COMMITTEE

IX. FUTURE MEETINGS

February 16, 2005 at 6:00 p.m.

Regionalization Report Status

March 2, 2005 at 6:30 p.m.

X. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting adjourned at 7:00 p.m.