



MINUTES

City of Ypsilanti HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION Virtual Meeting held via Zoom

Tuesday, January 26, 2021
7:00 P.M.

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Chairperson Pettit Video/telephone usage instructions given for potential attendees
Meeting called to order at 7:05pm

Commissioners Present: Alex Pettit – Washtenaw County, City of Ypsilanti
Erika Lindsay – Washtenaw County, City of Ypsilanti
Amy Swift – Washtenaw County, City of Ypsilanti
James Chesnut – Washtenaw County, City of Ypsilanti
James Ratzlaff – Washtenaw County, City of Ypsilanti

Commissioners Absent: Anne Stevenson, Ron Rupert

Staff Present: Scott Slagor, Preservation Planner
Nancy Hare-Dickerson, Commission Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Motion: Lindsay (second: Swift) moved to approve the agenda as submitted.

Roll Call Vote - Ayes: Commissioners Pettit, Lindsay, Swift, Chesnut, Ratzlaff
Nays: None
Absent: Commissioners Stevenson, Rupert
Motion carried.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA ITEMS—none

PUBLIC HEARING—none

OLD BUSINESS
301 S Washington

**Door.*

Applicant: Bryan Young, owner - present

Commissioner Ratzlaff recused himself from discussion and voting/turned off his video and microphone, having cited a possible conflict in being a direct neighbor to the property.

Discussion: Pettit: Summarized that per the previous discussion held at the January 12, 2021 HDC meeting, that applicant was going to look for some new or pre-existing door options that more closely matched the historic door to bring back to the Commission to review.

[Review and discussion ensued as to the details of the four (4) door options presented by applicant, reference photo and document materials]

[Further discussion as to the possible appropriateness of the new steel door option, identified as option number four (4)]

Motion: Lindsay (second: Chesnut) moved to issue a Notice to Proceed for the work at 301 S Washington as submitted in the application dated January 5, 2021, and amended January 19, 2021, for installation of a new steel door matching option number 4, as specified, with the condition that the new door shall have a smooth finish rather than faux wood grain. The Commission acknowledges that the original door is an irreplaceable loss and this new door, at minimum, meets the design guidelines in the Door Fact Sheet.

Secretary of the Interior Standards:

#9- Contemporary designs shall be compatible and shall not destroy significant original material.

#10- New work shall be removable.

Roll Call Vote - Ayes: Commissioners Pettit, Lindsay, Swift, Chesnut

Abstain: Commissioner Ratzlaff

Nays: None

Absent: Commissioners Stevenson, Rupert

Motion carried.

NEW BUSINESS

301 S Washington

**Window.*

Applicant: Bryan Young, owner - present

****Commissioner Ratzlaff recused himself from discussion and voting/turned off his video and microphone, having cited a possible conflict in being a direct neighbor to the property.****

Discussion: Pettit: Indicated that there was previous discussion held at the January 12, 2021 HDC meeting regarding the window.

Note per Staff Review: This application is to amend work that was completed without a permit. The work as completed was originally proposed at the January 12, 2021 meeting. In a "straw poll" the Commission did not agree with the work, so the applicant amended to have it removed. This subsequent application is to correct the unapproved work.

Young: *[Discussed a "horizontal window" option, reference marked-up photos]*. Indicated that the proposed window option will be the same amount of light as all the other windows, size wise, but instead of going up and down, it will go left and right.

Pettit: Asked if applicant had anything showing what the window fenestration would look like.

Young: Stated that it would be the same type of window that you are looking at right now *[reference photo]*. It just would be the size of – instead of going vertical, it would be going horizontal and would still be a double hung.

[Clarifying discussion continued as to the new proposed window option]

[Discussion as to trim considerations]

Pettit: Indicated that at this point, the Commission has some general idea about how the opening size can possibly be changed but no real specifics as to what is going in there. Indicated that rather than general proportions, it would be helpful for the Commission to see something more concrete as to how big that opening is going to be *[reference photos]* and what a proposed window arrangement would be that goes in to that opening.

[Discussion continued regarding the proposed window arrangement, including the importance of proportionality and materiality]

Motion: Chesnut (second: Lindsay) moved to deny the application for work at 301 S Washington as submitted in the application dated January 19, 2021, for installation of a horizontal sliding vinyl window on the south elevation. A horizontal sliding window is not appropriate for a mid-nineteenth century house where all other windows are double-hung sashes. Additionally, vinyl is an incompatible material with the Historic District as it does not expand and contract at the same rate as wood, is not repairable, and does not have a finish or profile consistent with historic wood windows.

Secretary of the Interior Standards:

#6- Repair don't replace, replacements shall match the original.

#9- Contemporary designs shall be compatible and shall not destroy significant original material.

Roll Call Vote - Ayes: Commissioners Pettit, Lindsay, Swift, Chesnut

Abstain: Commissioner Ratzlaff

Nays: None

Absent: Commissioners Stevenson, Rupert

Motion carried.

208 E Cross

**Siding.*

Applicant: Carrie Taylor, owner - present

Discussion: Pettit: Indicated that the application is for siding work. Asked applicant to talk the Commission

through what is planned.

Taylor: Indicated that she previously addressed the Commission as a study item *[October 13, 2020]*, in which it was discussed that she would return with an application providing multiple options.

[Reference photo and document materials, discussion ensued, with applicant clarifying three (3) siding options as to details, preference and cost]

Motion: Swift (second: Chesnut) moved to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 208 E Cross as submitted in the application dated January 19, 2021 for siding work as specified in either options 2a or 2b. In either option, it is suggested that the new boards be fed in along the seams with the Hardie Board and, in Option 2a, that the division between Hardie Board and shake be emphasized with a piece of trim to match the current trim color and material.

Secretary of the Interior Standards:

#9- Contemporary designs shall be compatible and shall not destroy significant original material.

Roll Call Vote - Ayes: Commissioners Pettit, Lindsay, Swift, Chesnut, Ratzlaff
Nays: None
Absent: Commissioners Stevenson, Rupert
Motion carried.

STUDY ITEMS—none

ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS—none

OTHER BUSINESS

- 1. 2020 City of Ypsilanti Annual Report - Historic District Commission and Historic Preservation Program**
- 2. 2020 Annual Certified Local Government Report for State Historic Preservation Office**

[Staff provided an overview of the information detailed in the two (2) reports. Commissioner query and comments followed]

Motion: Chesnut (second: Ratzlaff) moved to adopt the 2020 City of Ypsilanti Annual Report - Historic District Commission and Historic Preservation Program; and moved to adopt the 2020 Annual Certified Local Government Report for the State Historic Preservation Office.

Roll Call Vote - Ayes: Commissioners Pettit, Lindsay, Swift, Chesnut, Ratzlaff
Nays: None
Absent: Commissioners Stevenson, Rupert
Motion carried.

- 3. Property Monitoring**
Commissioners/Staff discussed property issues under review.

4. Updates from Staff

Re: Reminder - Nominations for chair/vice chair at next meeting

5. Commissioner Comments— Commissioners, who wished, shared additional thoughts.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

One comment received: Bryan Young.

HOUSEKEEPING BUSINESS

1. Approval of the minutes of January 12, 2021

Motion: Chesnut (second: Lindsay) moved to approve the minutes of January 12, 2021, as submitted.

Roll Call Vote - Ayes: Commissioners Pettit, Lindsay, Swift, Chesnut, Ratzlaff
Nays: None
Absent: Commissioners Stevenson, Rupert
Motion carried.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Pettit adjourned the meeting, citing the end of the agenda with no further items to discuss.

MEETING ADJOURNED at 9:42 p.m.

Full Minutes Prepared By: Nancy Hare-Dickerson