



MINUTES

City of Ypsilanti HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION Virtual Meeting held via Zoom

Tuesday, September 28, 2021
7:00 P.M.

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Chairperson Pettit Video/telephone usage instructions given for potential attendees
Meeting called to order at 7:02pm

Commissioners Present: Alex Pettit – Washtenaw County, City of Ypsilanti
Amy Swift – Washtenaw County, City of Ypsilanti
James Chesnut – Washtenaw County, City of Ypsilanti
James Ratzlaff – Washtenaw County, City of Ypsilanti
Stefan Szumko - Washtenaw County, City of Ypsilanti

Commissioners Absent: Erika Lindsay

Staff Present: Scott Slagor, Preservation Planner
Nancy Hare-Dickerson, Commission Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Discussion: Staff requested to add 415 N Huron to the agenda as a study item.

Motion: Chesnut (second: Swift) moved to approve the agenda as amended.

Roll Call Vote - Ayes: Commissioners Pettit, Swift, Chesnut, Ratzlaff, Szumko
Nays: None
Absent: Commissioner Lindsay
Motion carried.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA ITEMS—none

PUBLIC HEARING—none

OLD BUSINESS—none

NEW BUSINESS

11 S Washington

**Mural - Amendment.*

Applicant: Sim Sethi, owner - present
Jennifer Goulet, Wonderfool Productions - present

Discussion: Slagor: Staff provided an updated review citing the following information — that the applicant presented a proposal at the last HDC meeting, on 9-14-2021, for a mural on the side elevation of the building; that an artist had not been selected at that time; that the application was amended and approved for the preparation work only.

Staff stated that the applicant has returned with an “inspiration piece” from the muralist to show an example of the scale and how the mural might interact with the architectural features of the building; that they would like the mural to be a bit larger than what is shown [*reference photo materials*]; that the wheat paste method which was discussed on 9-14-2021 will not be used; and that the final design will be derived from Ypsilanti youth.

Goulet: Provided information about the selected mural artist, the students who will be assisting and the vision for the installation. Confirmed that the mural artist was advised of the requirements of handling the architectural details of the building that were previously discussed with the HDC at the 9-14-2021 meeting, in which those details will also be included in the contract. Confirmed that the contractor is lined up to begin preparation of the wall per HDC requirements as previously discussed on 9-14-2021.

Sethi: Per query from Commissioner Ratzlaff, confirmed that the contractors know not to power wash the wall; that they will hand sand everything.

Goulet: Per query from Commissioner Swift regarding access due to the mural height and power lines, explained that the artist believes he will be able to access it, will be personally taking care of that portion of the work and will be very carefully hand-painting that area. Asked about the appropriateness of impacting the brick archway above each of the windows [*reference photo materials*].

Szumko: Stated not having a problem with painting the bricks.

Pettit: Indicated an opinion that it is not an issue in terms of mural application if it is brick detailing that is in the same plane as the rest of the wall.

Swift: Indicated agreement.

Ratzlaff: Indicated agreement.

Swift: Indicated an opinion that the masonry sills should be kept white, as presented, because they protrude out.

Goulet: Acknowledged.

Motion: Szumko (second: Swift) moved to approve and issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work

at 11 S Washington as submitted in the application dated September 8, 2021, for painting a mural on the south elevation and repainting the facade. The mural shall not obscure architectural details. The façade will be repainted with a color taken from the selected mural design.

Secretary of the Interior Standards:

#9- Contemporary designs shall be compatible and shall not destroy significant original material.

#10- New work shall be removable.

Roll Call Vote - Ayes: Commissioners Pettit, Swift, Chesnut, Ratzlaff, Szumko

Nays: None

Absent: Commissioner Lindsay

Motion carried.

407 E Cross

**Window Replacements.*

Applicant: Stewart Beal, owner - present

Discussion: Slagor: Staff provided an updated review citing the following information — that in July 2020, the windows on the house were erroneously replaced with double-hung vinyl windows due to a Building department permit error; that an application for the work was reviewed by the HDC on April 27, 2021 and denied, citing: "...the original six-over-six windows were a character-defining feature of the building and the new windows do not match the original windows in design or materiality and are not compatible with the character of the historic district."; that applicant returned three times for study items in order to build consensus around a design that would be a reasonable compromise and compatible with the historic character of the building and District.

Staff stated that the house was erected around 1870 as an Italianate-style house; that the building was converted to a duplex around 1921. Staff shared photos of before and after window replacements and discussed its history.

Staff stated that the proposal that was worked out in the study items, with consensus, was that because the west elevation and the rear north elevation were largely obscured from public view, that it would be reasonable to allow those windows to remain as vinyl double-hung and to focus on the façade and the east elevation because the east elevation is such a strong public view by having the open sight line to the gas station [*reference photo materials*].

Staff stated that applicant has returned before the Commission with a proposal for Marvin aluminum clad wood windows -- six-over-six in all the places that were previously six-over-six; that the lower window on the porch would have an awning style transom and an affixed lower sash; and that there are two double hung windows which would go on the addition [*reference photo materials/continued clarifying details*]. Staff also shared a photo of the windows that were removed.

Beal: Acknowledged staff's review; had no additional comment.

Pettit: Summarized questions/comments by commissioners shared in previous meetings.

Swift: Indicated being pleased with the proposed front window solution, and reasons.

Motion: Ratzlaff (second: Szumko) moved to approve and issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 407 E Cross as submitted in the application dated September 21, 2021 for replacement windows. The façade and east elevation windows shall be replaced with Marvin aluminum-clad wood windows as specified. The windows shall match the size of the original opening to the greatest extent possible and have exterior muntins where muntins are used. This proposal is a sufficient compromise to the work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness in July 2020, and therefore the previously replaced windows on the west and north elevations may remain. However, future window replacements on those elevations shall conform to HDC guidelines and match the historic character of the building.

Secretary of the Interior Standards:

#5- Preserve distinctive features.

#6- Repair don't replace. Replacements shall match original.

Roll Call Vote - Ayes: Commissioners Pettit, Swift, Chesnut, Ratzlaff, Szumko
Nays: None
Absent: Commissioner Lindsay
Motion carried.

STUDY ITEMS

415 N Huron

**Porch steps and deck.*

Property owner Steven Hudock discussed plans and options for replacing porch steps and deck installation.

ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

119 S Washington Roof

301 S Huron Gutters

302 W Cross Roof

Motion: Chesnut (second: Ratzlaff) moved to accept the administrative approvals cited above, as submitted by staff on 9-28-2021.

Roll Call Vote - Ayes: Commissioners Pettit, Swift, Chesnut, Ratzlaff, Szumko
Nays: None
Absent: Commissioner Lindsay
Motion carried.

OTHER BUSINESS

1. Property Monitoring

Commissioners/Staff discussed property concerns and status of property issues under review.

2. Updates from Staff

- a. Staff advised the Commission on the procedure for reviewing applications with multiple options. The State Historic Preservation Office advised that applicants should review multiple options as study items rather than action items so the HDC can make a clean motion. Discussion followed.
- b. Status of HDC commissioner vacancy.

3. Commissioner Comments—none

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS—none

HOUSEKEEPING BUSINESS

Approval of the minutes of September 14, 2021

Motion: Chesnut (second: Ratzlaff) moved to approve the minutes of September 14, 2021, as submitted.

Roll Call Vote - Ayes: Commissioners Pettit, Swift, Chesnut, Ratzlaff, Szumko
Nays: None
Absent: Commissioner Lindsay
Motion carried.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Pettit adjourned the meeting, citing the end of the agenda with no further items to discuss.

MEETING ADJOURNED at 8:59 p.m.

Full Minutes Prepared By: Nancy Hare-Dickerson